Performance evaluation of Fenton based processes in reducing COD of the petroleum effluents using the waste of steel slag

Fatemeh Etemadiasl

Shahid Chamran University of Ahvaz

Parvaneh Tishehzan (✉ ptishehzan@yahoo.com)

Shahid Chamran University of Ahvaz <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-5283-1047>

Seyed Mahmood Kashefipour

Shahid Chamran University of Ahvaz

Nematolah Jaafarzadeh Haaghighifard

Ahvaz Jondishapour University of Medical Sciences

Research Article

Keywords: EF, PF, PEF, COD, Taguchi, Steel slag, Petroleum effluent

Posted Date: June 13th, 2022

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.21203/rs.3.rs-1033579/v2>

License: This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License.

[Read Full License](#)

Performance evaluation of Fenton based processes in reducing COD of the petroleum effluents using the waste of steel slag

Fatemeh Etemadiasl¹, Parvaneh Tishehzan^{*2}, Seyed Mahmood Kashefipour³, Nematollah Jaafarzadeh Haaghighifard⁴

Abstract

Petroleum effluents pollution is an important challenge for many countries. The aim of this study was to investigate the efficiency of Fenton, Photo-Fenton (PF), Electro-Fenton (EF) and Photo-Electro-Fenton (PEF) processes in reducing chemical oxygen demand (COD) of desalination unit effluent using steel slag as catalyst, cathode and anode. For achieving this goal the experimental design by Taguchi method using Minitab18 software was used. The desired variables include pH (3, 5 and 7), hydrogen peroxide (5, 10 and 15 mmol/l), contact time (30, 60 and 90 min), catalyst (5, 7.5 and 10 g/L), radiant intensity (16, 24 and 32 W) and voltage (5, 15 and 30 V). In order to perform the experiments, the pilot was made using UV-C lamps (wavelengths of 200-280 nm) each with a power of 8 W and an AC power supply of 0-30 V in the range of 0-2 A. According to the results, PEF process under pH = 7, 10 mmol/l hydrogen peroxide, catalyst content of 5 g/L, radiant intensity of 24 W and voltage of 5 V for 90 min, provides the highest COD removal rate (98.7%). The present study showed that following the combined process of PEF, EF, PF and Fenton processes have a high potential in reducing COD using steel slag.

Keywords: EF, PF, PEF, COD, Taguchi, Steel slag, Petroleum effluent

1. Introduction

Treatment of industrial wastewater containing toxic and hazardous substances is one of the world's environmental challenges. Various methods are used to treat industrial wastewater, including physical, chemical and biological processes. Technologies such as adsorption or coagulation, transfer the contaminants from one phase to another and the contaminant is not completely eliminated (1). In recent years, among all chemical treatment processes, advanced oxidation process (AOP) methods have been widely studied due to their effective efficiency in removing various contaminants, especially stable organic contaminants (2).

¹ M.Sc. Student of Environmental Engineering, Environmental Engineering Department, Faculty of Water and Environmental Engineering, Shahid Chamran University of Ahvaz, Ahvaz, Iran. Postal Code: 6135743311., Email: Fatima_etemadi@yahoo.com, fatemeh-etemadiasl@stu.scu.ac.ir

² * corresponding author: Assistant Professor, Environmental Engineering Department, Faculty of Water and Environmental Engineering, Shahid Chamran University of Ahvaz, Ahvaz, Iran. Postal Code: 6135743311, Email: ptishehzan@yahoo.com, partishehzan@scu.ac.ir, Phone Number : 0098 09163050638, Fax Number : 00986133365670

³ Professor, Environmental Engineering Department, Faculty of Water and Environmental Engineering, Shahid Chamran University of Ahvaz, Ahvaz, Iran. Postal Code: 6135743311, Email: kashefipour@scu.ac.ir

⁴ Professor, Environmental Technologies Research Center, Ahvaz Jundishapur University of Medical Sciences, Ahvaz, Iran, Email: n.jaafarzade@yahoo.com, Jaafarzadeh-n@ajums.ac.ir

Advanced oxidation was first used for water treatment in 1980 (3,4). AOP processes are based on processes that produce an appropriate amount of active radicals such as hydroxyl radical ($OH^\bullet$), radical ($SO_4^{\bullet-}$) and oxygen radical ($O^\bullet$) (5–7).

Since hydroxyl radicals have high oxidizing power ($E^\bullet = 2.8$ V), they remove most contaminants (especially organic contaminants). These methods are more capable of treating toxic contaminants, usually do not have the problem of surplus disposition and waste, are performed at room temperature and atmospheric pressure and are relatively inexpensive, and also the reaction speed is fast (8). Advanced oxidation such as photochemical oxidation, wet catalytic oxidation, sonochemical oxidation, O_3 oxidation, electrochemical oxidation and Fenton oxidation are widely used for direct mineralization of organic contaminants or to improve the degradability of organic contaminants (9,10). Compared to other advanced oxidation processes, Fenton-Based processes (FPs) are the most popular due to some significant advantages such as wide application range, strong anti-interference ability, simple operation, fast degradation and mineralization (2,11–14). The chemical reaction of ferric iron ions and hydrogen peroxide releases hydroperoxy radicals that regenerate catalysts (ferro ions) (15,16). If the reaction starts with Fe^{+3} instead of Fe^{+2} , it is known as a Fenton-like process (17). FPs consist of two classes of homogeneous and heterogeneous processes; One of the problems in the homogeneous Fenton process is the production of iron sludge (possibly "ferric iron") followed by sludge disposal costs at the end of the process, which is estimated to be approximately 10 to 50% of the total costs associated with the wastewater treatment process. While the use of solid catalysts in the heterogeneous process of Fenton, an efficient way to reduce sludge has been developed (15,18–21). The chemical reaction of ferric ions and hydrogen peroxide releases hydroperoxy radicals that regenerate catalysts.

Various factors such as temperature, pH, H_2O_2 concentration, iron ion content, contact time, etc. affect the efficiency of FPs processes (22–26). Performance of FPs processes are different; Comparison between Fenton, EF, Sono-Electro-Fenton (SEF) and PEF processes for phenol removal showed that the degradation efficiency of the processes is as follows: $PEF < SEF < EF < Fenton$ (27). In the Photo Catalysis / PEF hybrid system 85% of TOC and 96% of COD were removed from effluent containing Polyaniline (28).

Testing all the parameters for different Fenton process requires a lot of time and cost, but in such cases, the experiment design method can be used. The Taguchi method is one of the experiment design that compared to factor methods provides advantages such as less number of experiments and therefore less cost and time of testing, the ability to evaluate the interaction effects and conducting experiments in parallel and ultimately predicting the Suitable response. In general, this method reduces the number of experiments required for optimization and increases the accuracy of the results. The most important and effective factor can be determined with this method (29,30) One of the important issues in electrochemical processes is selecting the right electrode (especially anode). The anodes such as BDD⁵, Pt, and DSA⁶ due to produce more powerful ($OH^\bullet$) have shown their high potential in removing various contaminants (31,32,41,33–40). Some studies have investigated the effect of the similar cathode and anode electrode (such as

⁵ Boron-doped diamond

⁶ Dimensionally stable anodes

identical electrodes of Na_2SO_4 (42); graphite electrodes (43) and identical BBD electrodes (32) in the Fenton based processes and achieved good results.

Khuzestan province in southwestern Iran has large industries such as oil and steel industries. High effluent pollution of oil desalination units and the presence of high slag in the steel industry are among the environmental problems of this region. Hence, the reuse of industrial effluents and steel slag by scientists, engineers and government officials to overcome the region's environmental problems is considered an important issue. Since, in novel research, the use of solid iron catalysts or iron-modified cathodes with it has shown good performance (44), therefore steel slag (containing iron compounds) was used as catalysts and electrodes. The present study aimed to compare different FPs processes in reducing pollution of petroleum industry effluents by using waste materials (steel industry slag). Also, the most effective parameters for reducing COD were identified in each of the processes using the Taguchi method.

2. Materials and methods

This study was designed and implemented to evaluate the efficiency of Fenton, PF, EF and PEF processes in reducing COD from effluents of petroleum desalination unit to reach evacuation standards in Iran, and its excessive reduction is not cost-effective.

In addition to, the effect of factors such as pH, contact time, catalyst content, hydrogen peroxide content, radiant intensity and current on the reduction efficiency of COD was investigated. The measured parameters of the effluent of one of the desalination units, by the petroleum-rich areas of the south have been presented Table (1). The catalysts for all four processes of F, EF, PF and PEF were selected from fine particle slag; also copal slag because of its nature was used as the cathode and anode for EF and PEF processes. According the XRF analysis (Table 2), the compounds of iron oxide and calcium oxide have the highest amount. Also, Table (3) shows the wavelengths of the different functional groups; Comparing it with Figure (1), which is related to the functional groups of steel slag, it was found that steel slag contains tensile functional groups -CH containing nitrate and $\text{C}=\text{O}$ (acid). The experiments were designed using Taguchi orthogonal array and Minitab 18 software. The results of the experiments were analyzed using Microsoft Office Excel and Minitab 18 software using two types of signal analysis to noise and variance.

2.1. Experiment design

The Taguchi method was used in order to reduce the number of experiments and considering the temperature has been one of the important parameters during the processes. Hence, signal-to-noise and ANOVA analysis has been investigated. This method minimizes the number of experiments required using orthogonal arrays. Arrays L_9 (3^4) and L_{27} (3^6) were used to determine the appropriate conditions based on this statistical model; this means that 4 and 6 effective parameters were selected as arrays, respectively, and examined at three levels, as shown in Tables (4).

Achieving Suitable conditions for a specific objective in Taguchi method is based on the signal to noise index S/N. S/N is the transformed value of the loss function used to measure the deviation of the performance characteristic from the ideal value. The higher S/N indicate the better performance of the system (45). The calculation method of S/N is

selected according to the to the intended purpose. Here, according to the goal of achieving the maximum range, S/N of "larger is better" type was used (46).

Table 1. Chemical properties of petroleum effluent used

parameters	Amounts	the unit	parameters	Amounts	the unit	parameters	Amounts	the unit
SO_4	410	ppm	PO_4	1.3	ppm	pH	5.33	—
F	4.5	ppm	NO_3	1.55	ppm	TDS	181000	ppm
CO_3	<0.1	ppm	NO_2	0.15	ppm	EC	362000	$\mu S/cm$
HCO_3	9	ppm	Cl	102930	ppm	COD	>10000	ppm
Bi	<0.1	ppm	Ba	<0.1	ppm	Ag	<0.1	ppm
Ca	60804	ppm	Be	< 0.2	ppm	Al	<100	ppm
Co	<1	ppm	Ce	<1	ppm	Cd	<0.1	ppm
Mg	6243	ppm	Fe	342	ppm	Cr	4	ppm
Li	41	ppm	Mo	<0.3	ppm	Cs	< 0.5	ppm
K	4993	ppm	Mn	6	ppm	Cu	<3	ppm
P	10	ppm	Zn	5	ppm	Na	<10	ppm
Pb	3	ppm	Ni	2	ppm	V	5	ppm
						S	972	ppm

Table 2. XRF analysis related to Khuzestan steel slag

Sample slag	SiO_2	Al_2O_3	Fe_2O_3	CaO	Na_2O	MgO	K_2O	TiO_2	MnO	P_2O_5
%	12.48	2.16	32.433	23.368	0.339	4.647	0.083	1.2	0.355	0.307

101

Table 3. Functional groups

Wavenumber (cm^{-1})	Assignment
3573	O-H stretch (water)
3319,3208	O-H stretch (water of hydration)
3100-3000	=C-H stretches
3000-2800	-C-H stretches
2230	Nitrile stretch
1647	C=O stretch (acid)
1566	C=O stretch (carboxylate) and C=C stretches
1517,1505	C=C stretches
1425	C-H deformation and C=C stretches
1258,1167,1142	C-O stretches
811,777,734	aromatic C-H deformations

102

103

Fig.1 :: FT-IR test results of steel slag

104

105

106

107

108

109

110

111

112

113

Table 4. Variables and levels

		Level 1	Level 2	Level 3
Fenton	pH	3	5	7
	H_2O_2(mmol/l)	5	10	15
	Catalyst (g/L)	5	7.5	10
	Time (min)	30	60	90
Photo-Fenton	pH	3	5	7
	H_2O_2(mmol/l)	5	10	15
	Catalyst (g/L)	5	7.5	10
	UV(W)	16	24	32
Electro-Fenton	pH	3	5	7
	H_2O_2(mmol/l)	5	10	15
	Catalyst (g/L)	5	7.5	10
	Voltag (V)	5	15	30
Photo-Electro-Fenton	pH	3	5	7
	H_2O_2(mmol/l)	5	10	15
	Catalyst (g/L)	5	7.5	10
	UV(W)	16	24	32
	Voltag (V)	5	15	30
	Time (min)	30	60	90

114

115 *2.2. Required solutions*

116 Solutions of sulfuric acid (98.08%), nitric acid (63.01%), sodium hydroxide (98%) for pH adjustment according to
 117 Taguchi orthogonal arrays design and H_2O_2 concentration (29-31%) were prepared from Merck Germany for
 118 experiments.

119 *2.3. Reactor used*

All experiments related to Fenton were performed on a 1250-cc beaker with a diameter of 90 mm and a height of 150 mm. To perform the PF test, a black box designed from wood was used to prevent the radiation from penetrating into the medium and to have a higher efficiency. In order to produce radiation from 4 UV-C lamps with a wavelength of 200 to 280 nm each with a power of 8 W and a total of 32 W, were installed vertically on all four sides of the box and a glass beaker with a volume of 1250 ml was placed exactly in the middle of the box so that of radiation should be uniformly reflected on the sample from each side. To perform an EF test, a Pyrex beaker with a volume of 1250 ml was used as the reaction medium, and the cathode and anode, both made of Copal slag, were placed in unknown shapes at a distance of 3 cm from each other. The power supply in this experiment was a variable voltage device of DAZHENG model PS-302 D with variable current characteristics of 0 to 2 A and variable voltage of 0 to 30 V. The required catalyst content and the required hydrogen peroxide (according to the required level) were added to each sample. In the combined state of PEF, two small holes (with the size of a wire) are made in the upper part of the black box, and the power cords of the cathode and anode are passed through them and connected to the AC power supply (Figure(2)).

Fig. 2 : Schematic Diagram of The Experimental PEF System

2.4. Test Method

For FPs processes, the required amount of slag as catalyst, cathode and anode was washed and then dried in an oven at 105 °C for 2 hours. Hydrogen peroxide and 0.1 N sodium hydroxide solutions were prepared. Then the pH value was adjusted using sulfuric acid and 0.1 N sodium hydroxide (portable pH meter model 330 I - WTW Germany). Certain catalyst content (weighed with a Japanese GF300 scale with an accuracy of 0.001 g) and hydrogen peroxide were added to the samples and the retention times according to the intended levels were applied using a stopwatch.

After performing experiments related to Fenton process and complementary experiments, the time parameter of 60 minutes was considered as the Suitable parameter for PF and EF processes.

To perform the PF test, the cathode and anode were both made of slag in unknown shapes placed at the distance of 3 cm. The required catalyst content and required hydrogen peroxide (Table 4) was added to each test sample and, the required retention time was applied.

Before and after the experiments, a certain volume of sample was taken and the COD content was measured using a spectrophotometer (Hach 5000) by closed reverse digestion (600 nm wavelength) (47). Then the percentage of COD removal was calculated according to Equation (1).

$$(1) \text{ Removal percentage} = 100 \times \frac{C_0 - C_1}{C_0}$$

Where C_0 and C_1 present the initial and final concentrations of COD, respectively.

2.5. Statistical analysis of data

After the experiments, signal-to-noise analysis and analysis of variance were performed on the removal percentages obtained using Mintab18 software. The following equation was used for S/N analysis (48):

$$(2) \quad \frac{S}{N} = -10 \log \frac{\sum_{i=1}^r \frac{1}{y_i^2}}{r}$$

Where y_i represents the response value for each experiment and r denotes the number of repetitions of each experiment.

3. Results and discussion

The Taguchi method provided 9 experiments for each of the Fenton, PF and EF methods and 27 experiments for the combined PEF method. The experiments were performed and the results were analyzed using MINTAB 18 software.

3.1. Fenton

Table (5) shows the average COD removal rate at different levels of each factor and Figure (3-a) displays the main effects for the signal-to-noise ratio in Fenton experiments. The highest and lowest removal percentages in the 9 experiments were 73.99% and 26.81%, respectively. Considering the range of slope variation, it can be said that the hydrogen-oxygen parameter has been the most effective factor on the Fenton process. The appropriate levels for each of the factors influencing the process are at the highest point, or the so-called highest signal-to-noise ratio, which, will result in the highest COD removal rate when applied. Therefore, the appropriate conditions to achieve the maximum response value are when pH = 7, H_2O_2 = 10mmol/l, catalyst = 10gram/liter and time is 60 min. Experimental factors in terms of maximum impact can be ranked according to the delta value (difference between the highest and lowest signal-to-noise values). Therefore, after hydrogen peroxide factor, pH, catalyst and time factors had the greatest effect on COD removal percentage, respectively (Figure (3-a) and Table 5).

172

Table 5. The average response value at different levels of each factor

		Level 1	Level 2	Level 3	Delta	grade
Fenton	pH	51.75	40.72	65.63	24.91	2
	H₂O₂(mmol/l)	37.21	69.5	51.39	32.28	1
	Catalyst (g/L)	44.9	48.48	64.73	19.83	3
	Time (min)	51.05	54.99	52.07	3.94	4
Photo-Fenton	pH	72.35	62.54	29.45	42.9	1
	H₂O₂(mmol/l)	65.92	52.66	45.76	20.15	3
	Catalyst (g/L)	46.04	55.48	62.82	16.78	4
	UV(W)	45.95	51.6	66.8	20.85	2
Electro-Fenton	pH	56.51	63.55	66.19	9.68	4
	H₂O₂(mmol/l)	86.13	35.03	65.09	51.11	1
	Catalyst (g/L)	69.81	60.29	56.15	13.66	3
	Voltag (V)	57.34	71.2	57.71	13.85	2
Photo-Electro-Fenton	pH	73.04	74.38	71.15	3.23	6
	H₂O₂(mmol/l)	65.09	82.17	71.31	17.08	3
	Catalyst (g/L)	79.63	63.84	75.09	15.79	4
	UV(W)	64.06	79.38	75.12	15.32	5
	Voltag (V)	61.81	80.19	76.57	18.39	2
	Time (min)	54.3	84.68	79.6	30.38	1

173

174 Basically, the Suitable contact time is a very important parameter in chemical reactions and if it exceeds the Suitable
 175 limit, the process will no longer be economic (49). The optical contact time of 60 min obtained in some other research
 176 (50).The highest COD removal percentage occurs at pH 7 for the Fenton process. However, some previous studies
 177 have shown that the Fenton process in the acidic state shows better performance (2).The contaminant adsorption rate
 178 on the catalyst surface increases with increasing the number of catalyst particles and the available surface area, which
 179 leads to the production of more hydroxyl radicals (51). By increasing the concentration of hydrogen peroxide from 5
 180 to 10 mmol/L, the COD removal percentage increases and then decreases with increasing H₂O₂ to 15 mmol/L. Excess
 181 concentration of H₂O₂ can act as a hydroxyl radical scavenger. It acts instead of a hydroxyl radical, HO₂●, which has
 182 less oxidizing ability and longer life compared to OH● (52).

183

Fig. 3: Diagram of the main effects for the signal-to-noise ratio related to the COD removal percentage.
a) Fenton process, b) PF process c) EF process, d) PEF process

3.2. Photo-Fenton

The maximum and minimum chemical oxygen demand in 9 experiments were 86.39 and 12.30%, respectively. The average COD removal rate at each level and for each factor has been shown in Table (5) and the main effects for the signal-to-noise ratio have been shown in Figure (3-b).

According to Figure (3-b), the most effective factor in the PF process was pH. Delta values in Table (5) also show that after pH, the most important factors are radiant intensity, hydrogen peroxide and catalyst, respectively. The appropriate levels for each of the factors influencing the process are at the highest point or so-called maximum signal-to-noise ratio. Therefore, the best conditions for PF test are pH = 3, H₂O₂ = 5mmol/l, catalyst = 10gram/liter and radiant intensity is 32 W.

As the radiant intensity increases, the potential for hydroxyl radical generation increases, resulting in higher COD removal rate. According to the diagram, it can be said that the Suitable radiant intensity is equal to 32 W. This finding is consistent with a study by Chinese researchers (using a 30 W lamp) for the PF process. (53). The most effective factor in this experiment was pH, which obtained the best conditions at an acidic value of pH = 3 unlike Fenton. The effect of this parameter on the PF process has been expressed differently in previous research. Some have preferred acidic pH (54) and some alkaline pH (52). Therefore, after pH, factor radiant intensity, hydrogen peroxide and catalyst

factors had the greatest effect on COD removal percentage, respectively (Figure (3-b) and Table 5). The hydrogen peroxide content at the lowest experimental value has given the best result which is consistent with other research (54). The amount of $HO_2\bullet$ (which has less oxidizing ability) increase at high level of H_2O_2 (52). As with the Fenton process, the highest COD removal rate is associated with the highest catalyst content.

3.3. Electro-Fenton

9 experiments were performed for the EF process, the highest and lowest COD removal rates were 93.42% and 25.82%, respectively. Table (5) and Figure (3-c) show the average COD removal rate at each level for each factor and the main effects for the S/N ratio. Given the signal-to-noise for each level of factors (Figure 3-c), the appropriate conditions for achieving the maximum response value are when the pH factors are at the third level (pH = 7), the voltage is at the second level (15 V), and the hydrogen peroxide and the catalyst contents are in the first level (5 mmol/l and 5 gram/liter, respectively).

The most effective factor is hydrogen peroxide and after that catalyst, voltage and pH, respectively, were effective on the EF process in the COD removal percentage (Figure 3-c). As with Fenton and PF conditions, the lowest hydrogen peroxide content has had the best response. But in the case of the catalyst in this process, these two reversal processes of Fenton and PF, lower catalyst content has provided more appropriate results. The pH, similar to the Fenton process, has performed better under neutral conditions.

3.4. Photo-Electro-Fenton

According to Taguchi design for this process, 27 experiments were performed. The highest COD removal rate was 98.78% and the lowest was 14.59%. Table (5) shows the average COD removal rate at different levels of each factor and Figure (3-d) shows the main effects for the signal-to-noise ratio in PEF experiments.

According to the slope of variations in Figure (3-d), it can be said that the most effective factors are time, voltage, catalyst, radiant intensity, hydrogen peroxide and pH, respectively. In this experiment, the highest COD removal rate will occur when the Suitable conditions for achieving the maximum response value include pH = 5, H_2O_2 = 10 mmol/l, catalyst = 5gram/liter, 24 W radiant intensity, 15 V and 60 minutes time.

Statistical analysis was performed to confirm the results of Taguchi method. Given the number of experiments performed on different processes, this study was feasible for the PEF process. Analysis of linear model of variance was performed for signal-to-noise ratio values and mean COD (Table 6). The results of multivariate analysis of variance showed that the time factor is significant at the level of one percent and the other parameters do not have a significant effect on the output variable. The study of the main effects of S/N ratio also showed a large effect of the time parameter. The R^2 value of the linear model was 61.65% and the S value was 10.7354. The parameter S is used instead of R^2 to compare the suitability of models without any constant. The value of S is measured in response variable units and indicates how much the data values fall from the corresponding values. The lower the S value, the better the model describes the response. However, a low value of S or a high value of the coefficient of determination

do not in themselves indicate that the model conforms to the assumptions of the model; The residual diagrams should be examined to validate the hypotheses (Figure 4). According to Figure (4), the residual values have been placed around the zero line, indicating the accuracy of the model. As observed in the NPP diagram, the points are almost on a straight line, indicating that the data is approximately normal. The residual versus order diagram is plotted for the independence of the observations. Given that the data are located around the horizontal axis, it can be said that our observations are completely independent and there is no correlation between them. According to the versus Fits diagram, it can be said that the assumption that the variances are constant is accepted. The shape of the histogram has a positive or straight skew. This means that the data have dissymmetry relative to the mean, and the larger data lead to the lower frequency.

Table 6. Analysis of variance for signal to noise ratio and COD values

Source	S/N			COD		
	DF	Seq SS	P	DF	Seq SS	P
pH	2	8.332	0.682	2	47.3	0.931
H2O2	2	33.093	0.245	2	1344.7	0.167
Catalyst	2	40.981	0.182	2	1189.1	0.201
time	2	142.693	0.009	2	4765.7	0.007
UV	2	37.218	0.209	2	1125.4	0.217
Voltage	2	45.613	0.153	2	1707.2	0.111
Residual error	14	148.541		14	4616.3	
Total	26	456.471		26	14795.9	

Then, Tukey test was used to find the factor or factors that have a significant difference with other factors.

Table (7) shows a Tukey pairwise comparison at the 95% confidence level. The results of Tukey test also showed that the factor of time has a significant difference with other factors for COD removal in the PEF process.

Fig. 4: Residual diagrams for COD removal percentage

Table 7. Tukey pairwise comparison at 95% confidence level (COD removal in PEF process)

Parameter	level	N	Avarage	Group
pH	2	9	74.3771	A
	1	9	73.0413	A
	3	9	71.1509	A
H2O2	2	9	82.17	A
	3	9	71.3064	A
	1	9	65.0929	A
Catalyst	1	9	79.6327	A
	3	9	75.092	A
	2	9	63.8446	A
Time	2	9	84.6752	A
	3	9	79.5962	A
	1	9	54.2979	B
UV	2	9	79.3821	A
	3	9	75.1239	A
	1	9	64.0633	A
Voltage	2	9	80.194	A
	3	9	75.5676	A
	1	9	61.8077	A

* Averages with different letters are significantly different from the others

3.4.1. Effect of experimental variables (PEF)

3.4.1.1 Effect of pH

The results of process PEF showed that with increasing this parameter, COD removal efficiency was increased first and then reduced. H ions played the scavenging role of hydroxyl radicals due to H high concentration at low pH and reduced the COD removal efficiency (2,55). Also, the solubility of ferrous ions might be decreased with increasing the pH of the solution, which adversely affected the production of hydroxyl radicals. Since at the high pH, the ferric-hydroxo complexes is produced as a consequence of ferric ions and the hydroxide ions reaction, the production of hydroxyl radicals would be slower (Equations (3) and (4)); finally, this complex had the tendency to polymerize at the pH 4 to 7 (Equations (5), (6) and (7)). Therefore, the range outside the acidic pH resulted in fostering iron ion-driven coagulation which could decrease the removal efficiency of the organic materials (56,57). Hence, the maximum COD removal at pH 5 was due to the reaction with hydroxyl radicals.

Considering previous researches, little information is available on the performance of the heterogeneous PEF process. On the other hand, in these studies, most experiments have been performed on acidic pH (where catalysts can be partially dissolved) (28,31,58–62). Thus, the efficiency of this process in neutral pH was also investigated. Experiments demonstrated that Fenton and EF processes performed best in neutral conditions and PF and EPF processes in acidic conditions. In PEF process, the rate of COD removal (due to reduced hydroxyl radical production) decreases near neutral. However, a decrease in system performance is observed at very low pH due to dissolution. This matter has been confirmed in previous research (63,64).

3.4.1.2 Effect of voltage

In the hybrid mode of the PEF process, the voltage level of 15 V is Suitable which is also economical in terms of energy consumption. Therefore, it can be said that in the PEF process, compared to the EF process, the COD removal efficiency has increased due to the use of radiation by applying a suitable voltage.

3.4.1.3 Effect of catalyst

Given that the compound Fe_2O_3 forms the major part of slag and has been recognized in previous research as the most effective compound in removing pollution; Therefore, it can play an important role in removing COD contaminants. In addition, the main role of the catalyst is played by slag. The composition Fe_2O_3 in steel slag can

release ferric ions in an acidic solution (while the pH of the effluent sample is also in the acidic range). Therefore, steel slag containing ferric ions can be used as An inexpensive catalyst in FPs (55,65,66). The experiments showed that the Suitable amount of catalyst in this process is equal to 5 gram/liter. The COD removal decreased for the catalyst amount of 7.5 gram/liter, and it increased again for the amount of 10 gram/liter. This final result being not consistent with the published data by Byrappa et al. (50). Because of the amount of contaminants absorbed on the catalyst surface decreased with the increasing number of catalyst particles. The reason was that the surplus ferrous ions or other compounds of the steel slag could act as scavengers of the hydroxyl radicals in the solution (2,67,68). It can be said that in general, when the amount of catalyst exceeds the Suitable value, due to the turbidity of the environment, UV rays do not effectively reach the surface of the catalyst, and thus the removal efficiency decreases. The conditions of our study are consistent with Bayat et al. (69) in terms of process and acidic environment.

Considering that catalyst values less than 5 g / l showed low efficiency in contamination removal during FPs processes. Moreover, The addition of certain amounts of slag catalysts in these processes increased the removal efficiency of the contaminant, thus it can be said that the slag catalyst certainly played an important role in removing COD contamination and can not be ignored.

3.4.1.3 Effect of H_2O_2

Given that the processes under study are heterogeneous Fenton-like, then H_2O_2 , as the dominant source of $HO\cdot$ under catalysis, plays a critical role in the treatment of organic effluents (2).

According to Figure (3-b), the rate of 10 mmol/l is Suitable for hydrogen peroxide which is consistent with the research by Felebuegu and Ezenwa (70). They were able to perform wastewater treatment operations during the Fenton-like oxidation process with this amount of hydrogen peroxide and other Suitable conditions. Since the concentration of $HO_2\bullet$ is higher than $OH\bullet$ in solution, the ability of any reactions of $HO_2\bullet$ is prevalent. It should be noted $HO_2\bullet$ has lower oxidizing ability and a longer lifetime than $OH\bullet$ (51).

On the other hand, The surplus molecules of hydrogen peroxide might consume hydroxyl radicals, by formation of hydroperoxy radicals ($HOO\bullet$) which have less reactivity in comparison to hydroxyl radicals. Therefore, the amounts of hydroxyl radicals were reduced and, subsequently, the COD removal efficiency was decreased (2,20,68). Therefore, it is necessary to find the suitable dose Which also depends on various parameters such as temperature, pH, COD and total suspended solids of pollutants (71).

3.4.1.4 Effect of radiation intensity

Obviously, with increasing radiation intensity, the potential for hydroxyl radical production increases, and thus it causes for increasing the removal efficiency of COD. However, by increasing the radiation from 24 W to 32 W, due to the high concentration of organic matter, contaminants settle on the catalytic surface and prevent light from reaching the catalyst, ultimately reducing the photocatalytic removal (72). As a result, according to Figure (3-d), it can be said that the Suitable radiation intensity is equal to 24 W, which is consistent with the research of Xing and Sun (52).

3.4.2.5 Effect of contact time

The time factor was not the only influential factor during the processes but it has played a role in eliminating pollution as an important parameter. The COD removal rate increases with increasing contact time. This increased time cause for more photon absorption by the catalyst surface and stimulate the photocatalyst, resulting in more free radical generation of $\text{OH}\bullet$ and higher removal efficiency. As shown in Figure (3-d), the S/N value increases significantly with increasing time to level 2 (60 min) and then decreases.

The Suitable contact time in the PEF process for COD removal is 60 minutes. The contact time is a very important parameter in chemical reactions, and if it exceeds the Suitable limit, it will not be an economic process (48). However, it should be noted that with increasing time, the pores of the cathode surface fill with contaminate, which reduces the production of H_2O_2 and ultimately reduces the removal efficiency. Babuponnusami and Muthukumar (27), compared different Fenton processes, and found that the amount of pollutant degradation in the PEF process is higher which is consistent with our study.

3.5. Comparison of the efficiency of different processes for COD removal

In order to evaluate the efficiency of PEF process, the role of Fenton, PF, EF processes on the COD removal was investigated under the conditions of the highest removal percentage obtained. The effect of different processes on COD removal efficiency has been shown in Figure (5). According to Figure (5), it can be seen that PEF, EF, PF and Fenton, respectively, have high efficiency of removing COD from the desalination unit effluent samples. On average, they have between 70 and 100 percent COD removal capability. It seems that dissolved iron in the studied effluent has helped to increase the production of H_2O_2 (especially in electrochemical processes) (73,74).

Fig. 5: The COD removal rate in various processes

4. Conclusion

Among the numerous advanced oxidation processes to reduce the chemical oxygen demand of petroleum effluents, FPs methods are prominent. The chemical oxygen demand (COD) in the petroleum contaminated effluent during Fenton, PF, EF and PEF processes under the conditions of maximum removal is 74%, 86.39%, 93.42% and 98.781%, respectively, which shows that the combined PEF process with the highest rate of COD removal has a greater ability to mineralize the contaminated oil effluent; after that, EF, PF and Fenton processes have a good ability to reduce organic contaminants, respectively.

Considering the removal percentages obtained during these processes, it can be said that the slag fine particle catalyst of Khuzestan Steel Industries can be a suitable alternative to iron ions in FPs processes as a catalyst. Also, copal slag of steel industries of Khuzestan province, with suitable electrical resistance and current establishment, can be used as a cathode and anode in FPs electrochemical process. Slag catalyst as a waste of Khuzestan steel industry has a very good potential for the treatment of petroleum industry effluents with very high organic pollution and resistant to biodegradation.

Although this study revealed the high potential of steel slag in the Fenton process for COD removal of the industrial effluents, more research is needed to test the process for specific pollutants, particularly types of residual hydrocarbons, Polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons.

The results show that although FPs processes can be used to reduce chemical oxygen demand pollution from petroleum industry desalination effluents; but the combined PEF process has a higher potential than other processes in removing chemical oxygen demand contamination from the effluent. The implementation of this system for the treatment of industrial effluents such as oil is recommended due to its high efficiency in reducing pollution, cost-effectiveness in industry, simplicity of work and ultimately less toxicity.

5. Acknowledgements

We are grateful to the Research Council of Shahid Chamran University of Ahvaz for financial support (GN: SCU.WI98.25891)

Abbreviation signs

Gram per liter = g/l

Ampere = A

Watt =W

Volt = V

Millimol per liter = mmol/l

384 Minutes= min

385

386 **Declarations**

387 -Ethics approval and consent to participate: 'Not applicable'

388 -Consent for publication: 'Not applicable'

389 -Availability of data and materials: The datasets used and analysed during the current study are available from the
390 corresponding author on reasonable request.

391 -Competing interests: The authors declare that they have no competing interests.

392 -Funding: This research has been financially supported by the Research Council of Shahid Chamran University of
393 Ahvaz.

394 -Authors' contributions: All authors conceived and designed the study. F.E carried out the experiments. Both F.E
395 and P.T analysed the data, wrote the manuscript, and discussed the results. All authors contributed to manuscript
396 revision and approve it.

397 Acknowledgements: We are grateful to the Research Council of Shahid Chamran University of Ahvaz for financial
398 support (GN: SCU.WI98.25891)

399 **6. Reference**

- 400 1. Padmanabhan PVA, Sreekumar KP, Thiyagarajan TK, Satpute RU, Bhanumurthy K, Sengupta P, et al.
401 Nano-crystalline titanium dioxide formed by reactive plasma synthesis. *Vacuum*. 2006;80(11–12):1252–5.
- 402 2. Wang N, Zheng T, Zhang G, Wang P. A review on Fenton-like processes for organic wastewater treatment.
403 *J Environ Chem Eng*. 2016;4(1):762–87.
- 404 3. Glaze WH. Drinking-water treatment with ozone. *Environ Sci Technol*. 1987;21(3):224–30.
- 405 4. Glaze WH, Kang J-W, Chapin DH. The chemistry of water treatment processes involving ozone, hydrogen
406 peroxide and ultraviolet radiation. 1987;
- 407 5. Deng Y, Zhao R. Advanced oxidation processes (AOPs) in wastewater treatment. *Curr Pollut Reports*.
408 2015;1(3):167–76.
- 409 6. Cho M, Chung H, Choi W, Yoon J. Different inactivation behaviors of MS-2 phage and *Escherichia coli* in
410 TiO₂ photocatalytic disinfection. *Appl Environ Microbiol*. 2005;71(1):270–5.
- 411 7. Ikai H, Nakamura K, Shirato M, Kanno T, Iwasawa A, Sasaki K, et al. Photolysis of hydrogen peroxide, an
412 effective disinfection system via hydroxyl radical formation. *Antimicrob Agents Chemother*.
413 2010;54(12):5086–91.
- 414 8. Gaya UI, Abdullah AH. Heterogeneous photocatalytic degradation of organic contaminants over titanium
415 dioxide: a review of fundamentals, progress and problems. *J Photochem Photobiol C Photochem Rev*.
416 2008;9(1):1–12.
- 417 9. Bokare AD, Choi W. Review of iron-free Fenton-like systems for activating H₂O₂ in advanced oxidation
418 processes. *J Hazard Mater*. 2014;275:121–35.

- 419 10. Sharma A, Ahmad J, Flora SJS. Application of advanced oxidation processes and toxicity assessment of
420 transformation products. *Environ Res.* 2018;167:223–33.
- 421 11. Chen L, Ma J, Li X, Zhang J, Fang J, Guan Y, et al. Strong enhancement on Fenton oxidation by addition of
422 hydroxylamine to accelerate the ferric and ferrous iron cycles. *Environ Sci Technol.* 2011;45(9):3925–30.
- 423 12. Miklos DB, Remy C, Jekel M, Linden KG, Drewes JE, Hübner U. Evaluation of advanced oxidation
424 processes for water and wastewater treatment—A critical review. *Water Res.* 2018;139:118–31.
- 425 13. Huang D, Hu C, Zeng G, Cheng M, Xu P, Gong X, et al. Combination of Fenton processes and biotreatment
426 for wastewater treatment and soil remediation. *Sci Total Environ.* 2017;574:1599–610.
- 427 14. Barreto-Rodrigues M, Silva FT, Paiva TCB. Optimization of Brazilian TNT industry wastewater treatment
428 using combined zero-valent iron and fenton processes. *J Hazard Mater.* 2009;168(2–3):1065–9.
- 429 15. Neyens E, Baeyens J. A review of classic Fenton’s peroxidation as an advanced oxidation technique. *J*
430 *Hazard Mater.* 2003;98(1–3):33–50.
- 431 16. Duesterberg CK, Cooper WJ, Waite TD. Fenton-mediated oxidation in the presence and absence of oxygen.
432 *Environ Sci Technol.* 2005;39(13):5052–8.
- 433 17. Fu F, Wang Q, Tang B. Fenton and Fenton-like reaction followed by hydroxide precipitation in the removal
434 of Ni (II) from NiEDTA wastewater: a comparative study. *Chem Eng J.* 2009;155(3):769–74.
- 435 18. Munoz M, De Pedro ZM, Casas JA, Rodriguez JJ. Preparation of magnetite-based catalysts and their
436 application in heterogeneous Fenton oxidation—a review. *Appl Catal B Environ.* 2015;176:249–65.
- 437 19. Pliego G, Zazo JA, Blasco S, Casas JA, Rodriguez JJ. Treatment of highly polluted hazardous industrial
438 wastewaters by combined coagulation–adsorption and high-temperature Fenton oxidation. *Ind Eng Chem*
439 *Res.* 2012;51(7):2888–96.
- 440 20. Zheng J, Gao Z, He H, Yang S, Sun C. Efficient degradation of Acid Orange 7 in aqueous solution by iron
441 ore tailing Fenton-like process. *Chemosphere.* 2016;150:40–8.
- 442 21. Gągol M, Przyjazny A, Boczkaj G. Wastewater treatment by means of advanced oxidation processes based
443 on cavitation—a review. *Chem Eng J.* 2018;338:599–627.
- 444 22. Stepnowski P, Siedlecka EM, Behrend P, Jastorff B. Enhanced photo-degradation of contaminants in
445 petroleum refinery wastewater. *Water Res.* 2002;36(9):2167–72.
- 446 23. Meriç S, Kaptan D, Ölmez T. Color and COD removal from wastewater containing Reactive Black 5 using
447 Fenton’s oxidation process. *Chemosphere.* 2004;54(3):435–41.
- 448 24. Mousavi SA, Mahvi AH, Mesdaghinia A, Nasseri S, Honari HR. Fenton oxidation efficiency in removal of
449 detergents from water. *J Water Wastewater.* 2010;72:16–23.
- 450 25. Jaafarzadeh N, Ghanbari F, Moradi M. Photo-electro-oxidation assisted peroxymonosulfate for
451 decolorization of acid brown 14 from aqueous solution. *Korean J Chem Eng.* 2015;32(3):458–64.
- 452 26. Lopez-Saavedra N, Muñoz-Delgado LF, Lara-Ramos JA, Machuca-Martinez F. Experimental data on the
453 degradation of caffeine by photo-electro-fenton using BDD electrodes at pilot plant. *Data Br.* 2018;21:1709–
454 15.
- 455 27. Babuponnusami A, Muthukumar K. Advanced oxidation of phenol: a comparison between Fenton, electro-
456 Fenton, sono-electro-Fenton and photo-electro-Fenton processes. *Chem Eng J.* 2012;183:1–9.
- 457 28. Ou B, Wang J, Wu Y, Zhao S, Wang Z. Treatment of polyaniline wastewater by coupling of photoelectro-
458 Fenton and heterogeneous photocatalysis with black TiO₂ nanotubes. *ACS Omega.* 2019;4(6):9664–72.
- 459 29. Yonar T, Kurt A. Treatability studies of hospital wastewaters with AOPs by Taguchi’s experimental design.
460 *Glob Nest J.* 2017;19:505–10.

- 461 30. Suraj P, Kumar V, Thakur C, Ghosh P. Taguchi optimization of COD removal by heterogeneous Fenton
462 process using copper ferro spinel catalyst in a fixed bed reactor—RTD, kinetic and thermodynamic study. *J*
463 *Environ Chem Eng.* 2019;7(1):102859.
- 464 31. Ye Z, Steter JR, Centellas F, Cabot PL, Brillas E, Sirés I. Photoelectro-Fenton as post-treatment for
465 electrocoagulated benzophenone-3-loaded synthetic and urban wastewater. *J Clean Prod* [Internet].
466 2019;208:1393–402. Available from:
467 <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0959652618331974>
- 468 32. Villanueva-Rodríguez M, Bello-Mendoza R, Wareham DG, Ruiz-Ruiz EJ, Maya-Treviño M de L.
469 Discoloration and organic matter removal from coffee wastewater by electrochemical advanced oxidation
470 processes. *Water, Air, Soil Pollut.* 2014;225(12):1–11.
- 471 33. Moreira FC, Boaventura RAR, Brillas E, Vilar VJP. Electrochemical advanced oxidation processes: A
472 review on their application to synthetic and real wastewaters. *Appl Catal B Environ* [Internet].
473 2017;202:217–61. Available from: <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0926337316306440>
- 474 34. Flores N, Sirés I, Garrido JA, Centellas F, Rodríguez RM, Cabot PL, et al. Degradation of trans-ferulic acid
475 in acidic aqueous medium by anodic oxidation, electro-Fenton and photoelectro-Fenton. *J Hazard Mater*
476 [Internet]. 2016;319:3–12. Available from:
477 <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0304389415302405>
- 478 35. Brillas E, Martínez-Huitle CA. Decontamination of wastewaters containing synthetic organic dyes by
479 electrochemical methods. An updated review. *Appl Catal B Environ* [Internet]. 2015;166–167:603–43.
480 Available from: <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0926337314007176>
- 481 36. Steter JR, Brillas E, Sirés I. On the selection of the anode material for the electrochemical removal of
482 methylparaben from different aqueous media. *Electrochim Acta* [Internet]. 2016;222:1464–74. Available
483 from: <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0013468616324616>
- 484 37. Komtchou S, Dirany A, Drogui P, Robert D, Lafrance P. Removal of atrazine and its by-products from
485 water using electrochemical advanced oxidation processes. *Water Res* [Internet]. 2017;125:91–103.
486 Available from: <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S004313541730698X>
- 487 38. Thiam A, Salazar R. Fenton-based electrochemical degradation of metolachlor in aqueous solution by means
488 of BDD and Pt electrodes: influencing factors and reaction pathways. *Environ Sci Pollut Res* [Internet].
489 2019;26(3):2580–91. Available from: <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-018-3768-2>
- 490 39. Guelfi DR V, Ye Z, Gozzi F, de Oliveira SC, Machulek Junior A, Brillas E, et al. Ensuring the overall
491 combustion of herbicide metribuzin by electrochemical advanced oxidation processes. Study of operation
492 variables, kinetics and degradation routes. *Sep Purif Technol* [Internet]. 2019;211:637–45. Available from:
493 <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S138358661833226X>
- 494 40. Aveiro LR, Da Silva AGM, Candido EG, Antonin VS, Parreira LS, Papai R, et al. Application and stability
495 of cathodes with manganese dioxide nanoflowers supported on Vulcan by Fenton systems for the
496 degradation of RB5 azo dye. *Chemosphere* [Internet]. 2018;208:131–8. Available from:
497 <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0045653518309524>
- 498 41. Fayazi M, Ghanei-Motlagh M. Electrochemical mineralization of methylene blue dye using electro-Fenton
499 oxidation catalyzed by a novel sepiolite/pyrite nanocomposite. *Int J Environ Sci Technol* [Internet].
500 2020;17(11):4541–8. Available from: <https://doi.org/10.1007/s13762-020-02749-2>
- 501 42. Babuponnusami A, Muthukumar K. Removal of phenol by heterogenous photo electro Fenton-like process
502 using nano-zero valent iron. *Sep Purif Technol.* 2012;98:130–5.
- 503 43. Nidheesh PV, Gandhimathi R. Comparative Removal of Rhodamine B from Aqueous Solution by Electro-F
504 enton and Electro-F enton-L ike Processes. *CLEAN–Soil, Air, Water.* 2014;42(6):779–84.
- 505 44. Brillas E. A review on the photoelectro-Fenton process as efficient electrochemical advanced oxidation for
506 wastewater remediation. Treatment with UV light, sunlight, and coupling with conventional and other

507 photo-assisted advanced technologies. *Chemosphere* [Internet]. 2020;250:126198. Available from:
508 <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S004565352030391X>

509 45. Gönder ZB, Kaya Y, Vergili I, Barlas H. Optimization of filtration conditions for CIP wastewater treatment
510 by nanofiltration process using Taguchi approach. *Sep Purif Technol*. 2010;70(3):265–73.

511 46. Milkey KR, Samsudin AR, Dubey AK, Kidd P. Comparison between Taguchi Method and Response
512 Surface Methodology (RSM) in Modelling CO₂ Laser Machining. *Jordan J Mech Ind Eng*. 2014;8(1).

513 47. D1252-06 A. Standard Test Methods for Chemical Oxygen Demand (Dichromate Oxygen Demand) of
514 Water. ASTM, International West Conshohocken, PA; 2006.

515 48. Oh S-Y, Chiu PC, Kim BJ, Cha DK. Zero-valent iron pretreatment for enhancing the biodegradability of
516 RDX. *Water Res*. 2005;39(20):5027–32.

517 49. Coelho A, Castro A V, Dezotti M, Sant'Anna Jr GL. Treatment of petroleum refinery sourwater by
518 advanced oxidation processes. *J Hazard Mater*. 2006;137(1):178–84.

519 50. Byrappa K, Dayananda AS, Sajan CP, Basavalingu B, Shayan MB, Soga K, et al. Hydrothermal preparation
520 of ZnO: CNT and TiO₂: CNT composites and their photocatalytic applications. *J Mater Sci*.
521 2008;43(7):2348–55.

522 51. Tony MA, Purcell PJ, Zhao YQ, Tayeb AM, El-Sherbiny MF. Photo-catalytic degradation of an oil-water
523 emulsion using the photo-fenton treatment process: Effects and statistical optimization. *J Environ Sci Heal*
524 Part A. 2009;44(2):179–87.

525 52. Xing Z, Sun D, Yu X. Treatment of antibiotic fermentation wastewater using the combined polyferric sulfate
526 coagulation with Fenton-like oxidation. *Environ Prog Sustain Energy*. 2010;29(1):42–51.

527 53. Tambosi JL, Di Domenico M, Schirmer WN, José HJ, Moreira R de FPM. Treatment of paper and pulp
528 wastewater and removal of odorous compounds by a Fenton-like process at the pilot scale. *J Chem Technol*
529 *Biotechnol Int Res Process Environ Clean Technol*. 2006;81(8):1426–32.

530 54. Dehghani M, Shahsavani E, Farzadkia M, Samaei MR. Optimizing photo-Fenton like process for the
531 removal of diesel fuel from the aqueous phase. *J Environ Heal Sci Eng*. 2014;12(1):1–7.

532 55. Chiou C-S, Chang C-F, Chang C-T, Shie J-L, Chen Y-H. Mineralization of Reactive Black 5 in aqueous
533 solution by basic oxygen furnace slag in the presence of hydrogen peroxide. *Chemosphere*. 2006;62(5):788–
534 95.

535 56. Kallel M, Belaid C, Mechichi T, Ksibi M, Elleuch B. Removal of organic load and phenolic compounds
536 from olive mill wastewater by Fenton oxidation with zero-valent iron. *Chem Eng J*. 2009;150(2–3):391–5.

537 57. Kuo WG. Decolorizing dye wastewater with Fenton's reagent. *Water Res*. 1992;26(7):881–6.

538 58. Flores N, Brillas E, Centellas F, Rodríguez RM, Cabot PL, Garrido JA, et al. Treatment of olive oil mill
539 wastewater by single electrocoagulation with different electrodes and sequential
540 electrocoagulation/electrochemical Fenton-based processes. *J Hazard Mater* [Internet]. 2018;347:58–66.
541 Available from: <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0304389417309597>

542 59. Mousset E, Huang Weiqi V, Foong Yang Kai B, Koh JS, Tng JW, Wang Z, et al. A new 3D-printed
543 photoelectrocatalytic reactor combining the benefits of a transparent electrode and the Fenton reaction for
544 advanced wastewater treatment. *J Mater Chem A* [Internet]. 2017;5(47):24951–64. Available from:
545 <http://dx.doi.org/10.1039/C7TA08182K>

546 60. Khataee AR, Zarei M. Photocatalysis of a dye solution using immobilized ZnO nanoparticles combined with
547 photoelectrochemical process. *Desalination*. 2011;273(2–3):453–60.

548 61. Khataee AR, Zarei M, Asl SK. Photocatalytic treatment of a dye solution using immobilized TiO₂
549 nanoparticles combined with photoelectro-Fenton process: Optimization of operational parameters. *J*
550 *Electroanal Chem* [Internet]. 2010;648(2):143–50. Available from:

<https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S1572665710003309>

62. Oriol R, Sirés I, Brillas E, De Andrade AR. A hybrid photoelectrocatalytic/photoelectro-Fenton treatment of Indigo Carmine in acidic aqueous solution using TiO₂ nanotube arrays as photoanode. *J Electroanal Chem.* 2019;847:113088.
63. Zhang L, Cheng H, Zong R, Zhu Y. Photocorrosion suppression of ZnO nanoparticles via hybridization with graphite-like carbon and enhanced photocatalytic activity. *J Phys Chem C.* 2009;113(6):2368–74.
64. Coronado JM, Fresno F, Hernández-Alonso MD, Portela R. Design of advanced photocatalytic materials for energy and environmental applications. Springer; 2013.
65. Heidari B, Soleimani M, Mirghaffari N. The use of steel slags in the heterogeneous Fenton process for decreasing the chemical oxygen demand of oil refinery wastewater. *Water Sci Technol.* 2018;78(5):1159–67.
66. Li Y-S, You Y-H, Lien E-T. Oxidation of 2, 4-dinitrophenol by hydrogen peroxide in the presence of basic oxygen furnace slag. *Arch Environ Contam Toxicol.* 1999;37(4):427–33.
67. Ali MEM, Gad-Allah TA, Badawy MI. Heterogeneous Fenton process using steel industry wastes for methyl orange degradation. *Appl Water Sci.* 2013;3(1):263–70.
68. Nasuha N, Ismail S, Hameed BH. Activated electric arc furnace slag as an efficient and reusable heterogeneous Fenton-like catalyst for the degradation of Reactive Black 5. *J Taiwan Inst Chem Eng.* 2016;67:235–43.
69. BAYAT BKR, EBRAHIMI M, KEYVANI B. Removal of Acid red 206 Dye in Pollutant Water by ZnFe₂O₄/Bentonite as a Nanophotocatalyst in Batch Reactor Using Taguchi Method. 2013;
70. Ifelebuegu AO, Ezenwa CP. Removal of endocrine disrupting chemicals in wastewater treatment by Fenton-like oxidation. *Water, Air, Soil Pollut.* 2011;217(1–4):213–20.
71. Chavoshani A, Amin MM, Asgari G, Seidmohammadi A, Hashemi M. Microwave/hydrogen peroxide processes. In: *Advanced Oxidation Processes for Waste Water Treatment.* Elsevier; 2018. p. 215–55.
72. Takeuchi M, Hidaka M, Anpo M. Efficient removal of toluene and benzene in gas phase by the TiO₂/Y-zeolite hybrid photocatalyst. *J Hazard Mater [Internet].* 2012;237–238:133–9. Available from: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jhazmat.2012.08.011>
73. Ganiyu SO, Zhou M, Martínez-Huitle CA. Heterogeneous electro-Fenton and photoelectro-Fenton processes: A critical review of fundamental principles and application for water/wastewater treatment. *Appl Catal B Environ [Internet].* 2018;235:103–29. Available from: <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0926337318303734>
74. Nidheesh P V, Zhou M, Oturan MA. An overview on the removal of synthetic dyes from water by electrochemical advanced oxidation processes. *Chemosphere [Internet].* 2018;197:210–27. Available from: <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0045653517321732>