

Can environmental protection policies promote regional innovation efficiency: A difference-in-differences approach with continuous treatment

Jianqing Zhang (✉ remembercx@foxmail.com)

Wuhan University

Hengyun Tang

Wuhan University

Minjun Bao

Wuhan University

Research Article

Keywords: Environmental protection policy (EPP), Regional innovation efficiency, Difference-in-differences approach (DID), Urban form, Mediating effect, Environmental regulations

Posted Date: April 18th, 2022

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.21203/rs.3.rs-1446132/v1>

License:  This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License.

[Read Full License](#)

1 **Can environmental protection policies promote regional innovation efficiency: A**
2 **difference-in-differences approach with continuous treatment**

3 **Jianqing, Zhang^{1,*} Hengyun, Tang¹ Minjun, Bao^{2,3}**

4 1. School of Economics and Management, Wuhan University, Wuhan 430072, China;

5 2. Institute for the Development of Central China, Wuhan University, Wuhan 430072, China;

6 3. Institute of Regional and Urban-Rural Development, Wuhan University, Wuhan 430072, China.

7

8 ***Corresponding author:** Jianqing, Zhang; E-mail: remembercx@foxmail.com; Address: School
9 of Economics and Management, Wuhan University, Wuhan 430072, China. Telephone: +86 139
10 0711 5857. Fax numbers: Not applicable.

11

12 **Acknowledgments:** This work was supported by the National Social Science Foundation of China
13 (grant number: 19BGJ033); National Natural Science Foundation of China (NSFC) Funded Projects
14 (grant number: 42071154; 71773141); Ministry of Education Philosophy and Social Science
15 Research Funded Project (grant number: 20JHQ064).

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26 **Abstract:** Environmental regulation and innovative development are essential means to solve the
27 negative externalities of environmental pollution. However, developing countries often face the dual
28 pressures of environmental pollution and innovative development. This paper focuses on whether
29 environmental protection policies (EPP) can achieve a win-win situation between green
30 development and innovative development. Based on the panel data of 277 cities in China from 2006
31 to 2016, this paper studies the impact of China's EPP on urban innovation efficiency by using a
32 time-varying difference-in-differences approach. Combined with the geographical features of
33 Chinese cities, we further take urban form into the mediating effect analysis. The results show that:
34 (1) EPP has a significant positive impact on innovation efficiency, and the result satisfies the parallel
35 trend test. (2) The robustness test shows that EPP has technological innovation and diffusion effects.
36 (3) The mediating effect test show that Urban form has a significant mediating effect on the impact
37 of EPP on innovation efficiency. Therefore, environmental policies should be formulated
38 considering the differences of urban form to achieve the optimal implementation effect.

39
40 **Keywords:** Environmental protection policy (EPP); Regional innovation efficiency; Difference-in-
41 differences approach (DID); Urban form; Mediating effect; Environmental regulations

42 43 44 45 1.Introduction

46 As the global largest trading country, China has primarily embedded downstream of global
47 value chains (GVCs) based on its labor and fossil fuel factor endowments after its accession to the
48 World Trade Organization (WTO) in 2001 (Antràs 2016). Although China's economy has grown
49 rapidly and already achieved remarkable results, its production process is mainly characterized by
50 high energy consumption, high pollution, low environmental protection, and low innovation
51 efficiency. Crane and Mao (2015) showed that the cost of environmental pollution in China between
52 2000 and 2010 was close to 10% of the gross domestic product (GDP) per year. Long-term extensive
53 development has led to high levels of embedding and pollution (a “double high”). In 2011, the State
54 Council of China promulgated the Strengthening Major Environmental Protection Policy (EPP),
55 which requires an overall improvement in environmental regulations. At the same time, it also

56 emphasizes the need to force technological innovation and transform the mode and path of
57 economic development. However, it is unclear whether environmental protection policies, which
58 are the main means of improving environmental regulation, will help improve China's innovation
59 efficiency.

60 The Porter hypothesis states that appropriate environmental regulations stimulate
61 technological innovation (Porter 1991). Owing to externalities and path-dependent issues,
62 technological innovation activities that contribute to the environment often lack market incentives,
63 and environmental policies can provide a driving force for such technological innovation activities.
64 In this study, we implemented EPP as a quasi-natural experiment to explore its impact on regional
65 innovation efficiency. We aim to provide a reference for formulating a reasonable environmental
66 regulatory intensity, promoting the improvement of technological innovation, and achieving energy
67 conservation goals.

68 There are three main novel contributions of this study. First, we included innovation input
69 variables, innovation output variables and innovation environment variables in the calculation of
70 innovation efficiency. It is relatively more reflective of processes along the entire innovation value
71 chain. In the baseline regression, we measured the overall innovation efficiency based on the super
72 loose measurement data envelopment analysis (sbm-dea) model. Second, we introduced a
73 difference-in-difference (DID) approach with a continuous treatment approach to analyze the impact
74 of EPP. The exogeneity of this policy further ensures the accuracy of our results. We used a
75 continuous measure of the intensity of treatment (i.e., ER), thereby capturing more variation in the
76 data. Third, we analyze how EPP affects the efficiency of regional innovation on the basis of taking
77 urban form as the intermediary variable. There is little literature that considers mechanism analysis
78 from the geographical characteristics of cities.

79 2.Literature review

80 2.1 Environmental policy and innovation

81 Nowadays, the relationship between environmental policy and innovation effect is a key issue
82 in the academic field. This relationship will be different due to different economic and
83 environmental backgrounds. The first concerns different economic environments, reflected in
84 different countries, cities, industry types, etc. Cai et al. (2020) believe that for technology capital
85 intensive industries, direct environmental regulation will actively and effectively promote green

86 innovation, but for labor-intensive industries, this effect is not significant. Martinez-Zarzoso et al.
87 (2019) used the number of patent applications to represent the extent to which enterprises'
88 innovation decisions are affected by environmental regulations. They found that countries with well-
89 functioning innovation systems are more vulnerable to environmental regulations. There is a
90 counter-cyclical relationship between environment-related innovation and CO₂ emissions in BRICS
91 countries. In terms of environment-related innovation and CO₂ emissions, the positive impact is
92 greater than the negative impact (Manzoor Ahmad et al. 2021). Qin et al. (2021) discussed the long-
93 term correlation between the strength of environmental policies and green innovation based on the
94 carbon neutrality goal. Yang et al. (2021) incorporated environmental regulation and green
95 innovation into the unified measurement model, indicating that the Water Ecological Civilization
96 City Policy(WECCP) can significantly improve the number of green patents in the pilot area,
97 especially the overall level of green innovation in small cities, but not in large cities. Second,
98 scholars analyzed the impact of different environmental policies on innovation. According to
99 Noailly et al. (2010), Green technology patents are used to characterize the level of building
100 technology innovation. Green technology patents here are related to building energy conservation.
101 the classification of different environmental policy tools (energy standard, price, and energy R&D
102 expenditure) and the influence mechanism of these policies on building energy conservation
103 innovation in seven European countries was studied. The strength of regulatory standards has a
104 significant impact on innovation capability, while energy prices have no significant impact.
105 Environmental regulatory enforcement does not have an effective promotion effect on green
106 technological innovation (Li et al. 2021). The focus of environmental policy implementation in the
107 short term is to compare the marginal benefit of environmental protection with the marginal cost of
108 pollution reduction (Jaffe et al. 2004). Specifically, the practical dynamic effects of environmental
109 policy tools are often unsatisfactory, which may be due to the difference between the theoretical
110 design and the practical effects of environmental policy; the implementation process is affected by
111 a series of factors from policy makers, policy implementers, the public, and stakeholders
112 (Hemmelskam et al. 1996).

113 In addition, Lanoie (2011) discussed the influence of environmental policies on enterprise
114 performance and innovation; the change of the relative price of factors prompted enterprises to
115 reduce the negative impact caused by environmental policies. Dechezlepretre and Glachant (2013)

116 focused on OECD countries, analyzed the relative impact of their domestic and foreign policies on
117 their technological innovation. It proves that foreign demand can better promote innovation growth.
118 Löschel (2002) included technological progress in the analysis of economic effects of environmental
119 policies from the perspective of enterprise, industry, and technological heterogeneity and believed
120 that technological progress is an endogenous variable derived from demand and competition. Ren
121 et al. (2021) used the two-stage least square method to deal with the potential selection bias, which
122 appeared between environmental technology innovation and environmental management
123 innovation. It was finally proved that environmental subsidies had a significant promoting effect on
124 the former, but not on the latter, and there was no significant correlation between the two.

125 2.2 Environmental regulation and innovation

126 The classic Environmental Kuznets curve (Grossman et al. 1991) shows that the relationship
127 between economic innovation growth and environmental norms presents an inverted U-shaped
128 curve. Specifically, in the initial stage of economic development and industrial development, the
129 scale effect of environmental supervision will be greater than the technical structure effect, and the
130 environmental level will decrease with economic growth. After entering the post industrial era, the
131 effects of technology and structure will exceed the scale effect. At this time, with economic growth,
132 the environmental quality will continue to improve. Nie et al. (2021) analyzed panel data of China's
133 coastal cities through supply chain management (SCM) and concluded that in China's less-
134 developed coastal areas, marine environmental protection regulations play a significant role in
135 promoting innovation growth, but this effect is not notable in relatively developed cities. Further,
136 environmental regulation impacts innovation not only like an "on" or "off," switch, it also acts as a
137 steering wheel that adjusts the direction of innovation (Kemp et al., 2000). Pickman (1998)
138 suggested that environmental regulations promote the flow of enterprise innovation resources to the
139 environment; the overall innovation input does not decrease, but other types of innovation are
140 replaced owing to such flow, resulting in a change in innovation direction. Lv et al. (2021) found
141 that environmental regulation can play a regulatory role in finance and innovation. The stronger the
142 environmental regulations, the innovation efficiency of green technology is improved.

143 The existing literature is mainly focused on the types of environmental regulations, industries,
144 and regional differences. One is the impact of different types of environmental regulations on
145 innovation. Jiang et al. (2021) found that in contrast to industrial environmental regulation, regional

146 environmental regulation is conducive to the improvement of enterprise innovation performance.
147 Compared with enterprise environmental information disclosure (EID), environmental management
148 system certification (EMSC) has a better incentive effect on enterprise innovation owing to the
149 higher cost of EMSC and stronger innovation motivation of enterprise environmental technology
150 (Jiang et al. 2020). Market-based environmental regulation helps promote technological innovation,
151 while control-based environmental regulation has no significant impact on innovation (Pan et al.
152 2019). Financial incentives have a good guiding effect on innovation (Hille et al. 2020). As a type
153 of market-based environmental regulation, carbon emission trading systems are expected to promote
154 emission reduction targets, while their impact on the innovation ability of enterprises is also
155 attracting attention. Therefore, a lack of sufficient funds to invest in innovative research and
156 development significantly reduces enterprises' innovation capacity (Shi et al. 2018). Peng et al.
157 (2020) used the DID method to analyze the regulatory effect of an SO₂ emission trading pilot (ETP)
158 and tested Porter's hypothesis. The results showed that in the implementation of SO₂ ETP, the more
159 conducive is market-based environmental regulation to the increase of the "innovation effect" in
160 enterprises, which is greater than the "compliance cost". The focus of sustainable environmental
161 policy is a combination of market-based environmental regulation and control-based environmental
162 regulation (Liu et al. 2020).

163 Second, the impact of environmental regulations on innovation in different industries. Adam B.
164 Jaffe (1996) characterized the intensity of environmental regulation by the expenditure directly
165 caused by environmental regulations, and found that the relationship between environmental
166 regulation expenditure and enterprise patent activities is not significant. However, even if the impact
167 is weak, after a specific industry is controlled, there is a positive correlation between cost tracking
168 and enterprise innovation input. Chakrabort et al. (2017) conducted a quasi-natural experiment in
169 the chemical industry and found that upstream enterprises' innovation activities produce a
170 "substitution effect" and reduce downstream enterprises' innovation investment. Hong et al. (2021)
171 used DID to test 6,631 chemical enterprises and found that the top 1000 Energy Consuming
172 Enterprises Plan (T1000P) had a negative impact on technological innovation. Rennings et al. (2010)
173 analyzed the enterprise data of the German technological innovation industry and believed that an
174 increase in environmental innovation would not reduce the overall innovation capacity of
175 enterprises; the results of environmental innovation were better than those of other innovation

176 directions. When focusing on specific industries, the two have opposite effects. For example, those
177 who insist on innovation in the transportation industry also need to pay compliance costs, which
178 greatly reduces their competitiveness. However, in industries such as waste utilization, such costs
179 are often transferred to customers or offset, and innovation compensation can play a major role.

180 Third, Cao et al. (2020) showed that the Yangtze River Delta Economic Belt has a high-quality
181 operation mode in terms of economic growth, environmental regulation, and innovation capacity,
182 and that the relationship between economic growth and environmental regulation presents an
183 inverted U-shape. Based on China's provincial regional data and spatial Dubin model, Dong et al.
184 (2020) tested the chain reaction of environmental regulation to local and adjacent areas and found
185 that there was a significant chain reaction of environmental regulation in geographically and
186 industrially adjacent areas, but not in economically adjacent areas. In addition, environmental
187 regulations promote investment in polluting industries in surrounding areas, and the overall green
188 technology innovation is not strong enough and presents a U-shaped change.

189

190 2.3 Environmental regulation affects the mechanism of innovation

191 Scholars have conducted extensive research on the mechanism by which environmental
192 regulation affects innovation. Ren et al. (2021), based on panel data of 11 provinces and cities in
193 coastal areas of China, verified that environmental regulations show different effect stages under
194 different technological innovation levels using the threshold effect model. In the low-level
195 innovation stage, the "compliance cost" of environmental regulations is greater than the "innovation
196 compensation"; the profit space of enterprises is compressed by the cost of environmental
197 regulations and enterprises cannot continue to invest in technological innovation. Once the high-
198 level innovation stage is entered, the path for enterprises to benefit from technological innovation
199 achievements can be constructed, and "innovation compensation" will play a major role. Enterprises
200 will be more willing to invest in technological progress and innovation to achieve a virtuous cycle.
201 Fan et al. (2021) further studied the spillover effect of environmental regulations on China's urban
202 environment by calculating the efficiency of green innovation, establishing a spatial econometric
203 model, and conducting a spatial autocorrelation test; the results showed that the intensity of
204 environmental regulations and the efficiency of green innovation showed a positive U-shaped
205 relationship. There is heterogeneity in the Porter effects in different countries. In developing

206 countries, the Porter effect is not common, but corruption is the key factor determining this effect.
 207 Taking China as an example, in regions where enterprises spend a lot on bribery and have a high
 208 degree of corruption, environmental regulation has a significant positive impact on enterprise
 209 innovation (Fu et al. 2021). At the same time, De Santis et al. (2021) verified the strong Porter
 210 hypothesis based on the environmental policies of 18 OECD countries and used hourly data to
 211 represent productivity, proving that the environmental regulation policies of OECD countries have
 212 a positive effect on productivity, especially in developed countries with information and
 213 communication technology. Countries can make better use of innovation opportunities provided by
 214 environmental policies to indirectly improve productivity and economic growth by promoting
 215 capital accumulation.

216

217 3. Background, data, and model

218 3.1 Background

219 From the early days of the founding of the people's Republic of China to the reform and
 220 opening up, and now, China's economy has achieved rapid development; alongside, unprecedented
 221 progress has been made in ecological and environmental protection. In particular, China's national
 222 environmental strategy and policies have undergone tremendous changes, evolving from "three
 223 wastes" governance to the governance of river basin areas. China's environmental protection policy
 224 has shifted from the implementation of total pollutant control to the improvement of environmental
 225 quality. At present, China has established an environmental strategic policy system that adapts to
 226 ecological civilization; "Beautiful China", China's national environmental protection policy, is
 227 generally released before or after the National Environmental Protection Conference (NEPC). The
 228 NEPC, chaired by the State Council, aims to make a series of major decisions to address China's
 229 environmental problems. To date, the NEPC has held eight sessions. The main contents of past
 230 NEPCs and their enactment policies are shown in Table 1.

231 Table 1. China's National Environmental Protection Conference (NEPC)

Year	Conference	Main Content	Policy
1973	The 1st National Environmental Protection Conference	Preliminary treatment of some seriously polluting industrial enterprises, cities and rivers has been carried out.	“Provisions on the Protection and Improvement of the Environment”
1983	The 2nd National Environmental Protection Conference	Environmental protection has been established as a basic national policy.	“Decisions on Environmental Protection”

1989	The 3rd National Environmental Protection Conference	Five new environmental protection systems and measures were proposed.	“Environmental Protection Goals and Tasks for 1989-1992”
1996	The 4th National Environmental Protection Conference	The policy of attaching equal importance to pollution prevention and ecological protection has been determined.	“Decisions on Several Issues Concerning the Strengthening of Environmental Protection”
2002	The 5th National Environmental Protection Conference	Environmental protection was proposed to be an important function of the government and an important part of sustainable development.	“National Environmental Protection ‘Tenth Five-Year Plan’”
2006	The 6th National Environmental Protection Conference	The direction of promoting comprehensive and coordinated sustainable economic and social development was proposed	"National Environmental Protection ‘Eleventh Five-Year Plan’”
2011	The 7th National Environmental Protection Conference	It was proposed to promote economic transformation and improve the quality of life	“The Strengthening Major Environmental Protection Policy”
2018	The 8th National Environmental and Ecological Protection Conference	It was proposed to increase efforts to promote the construction of ecological civilization and solve ecological and environmental problems.	"Opinions on Comprehensively Strengthening Ecological Environmental Protection and Resolutely Fighting the Tough Battle of Pollution Prevention and Control"

232

233 The rapid growth of China's economy is inseparable from the support of industry. Due to the
234 rapid development of heavy industry, China's ecological environment is facing an increasing threat
235 of pollution. In 2011, The State Council of China issued the Strengthening Major Environmental
236 Protection Policy. This was the first time that total pollutant control was raised to the height of the
237 national environmental protection strategy. Environmental protection planning has transformed
238 from soft to hard constraints. At the same time, this was also the first time that the State Council
239 had put forward opinions on the major work of environmental protection. Since the release of the
240 EPP, China's environmental protection investment has increased significantly, and is equivalent to
241 the total investment in environmental protection in the past 20 years. During this period, the sewage
242 treatment rate of cities in the country increased from 52% in 2005 to 72% in 2012. The harmless
243 treatment rate of municipal solid waste rose from 52% to 78%. The proportion of thermal power
244 desulfurization installed capacity increased from 12% to 82.6%. More than a decade has passed
245 since the implementation of the EPP, and its policy effects are visible. Therefore, we selected data
246 after the 6th NEPC and before the 8th NEPC for analysis. Owing to data limitations, the sample
247 selected for this study were from 2006 to 2016.

248 3.2 Regression model

249 To solve the bidirectional causality problem is the key of econometric model, especially in
250 environmental economics literatures (Fan, Lian and Wang, 2020; Fan and Zhang, 2021). For cities,

251 the implementation of EPP has a certain exogeneity. This is because China's environmental policy
 252 is formulated by the State Council and the State Environmental Protection Administration of China.
 253 The prefecture-level municipal governments can hardly exert a influence on the policy-making
 254 process. Hence, we take the implement of EPP as an ideal "quasi-natural experiment". Therefore,
 255 the DID model based on quasi-natural experiments can alleviate endogenous problems to a large
 256 extent. Spatial DID methods based on spatial weight matrices are commonly used in city-level
 257 empirical studies. However, some scholars have started to focus on the endogeneity of the spatial
 258 weight matrix, which assumes that the spatial weight matrix is not exogenous given. They assume
 259 that the spatial weight matrix includes an unknown nonparametric function to be estimated by the
 260 model (Kelejian and Piras, 2014). Qu and Lee (2015) point out that the exogeneity of the spatial
 261 weight matrix is a key to ensure the accuracy of empirical results. If the spatial weight matrix is
 262 endogenous, then the empirical results will be biased. Therefore, referring to Qian (2008), the
 263 regression model is constructed by the DID method with continuous processing in this paper as
 264 shown in Equation (1):

$$265 \quad IE_{it} = \beta_0 + \beta_1 EPP_{it} + \gamma X_{it} + \Phi_t + \mu_i + \varepsilon_{it} \quad (1)$$

266 where subscript i denotes city and t denotes year; IE_{it} is the dependent variable, which denotes the
 267 innovation efficiency of city i in year t . $EPP_{it} = ER_{it} * After_{it}$, and it's the DID variable with a
 268 continuous treatment. ER_{it} denotes the indicator of environmental regulation of city i in year t . $after_t$
 269 is the dummy variable denoting whether city i is treated in year t . EPP came into effect in 2011, so
 270 when $t < 2011$ $after_t$ is 0, otherwise it's 1. β_1 is the estimated coefficient that represents the impact of
 271 EPP on regional innovation. X_{it} is the set of control variables. ε_{it} is the random disturbance term in
 272 the model. Φ_t and μ_i represent the year fixed effect and city fixed effect, respectively.

273 3.3 Data sources and description

274 The data in this paper come from city-level databases of China, including China Urban Statistical
 275 Yearbook, China Regional Economic Statistical Yearbook and China Statistical Yearbook. After
 276 merging, the final sample used in this paper is panel data of 277 cities in China from 2006 to 2016.
 277 Control variables are as follows.

278 (1) GDP per capita (G): Howells (2005) pointed out that there was a positive and significant
 279 impact of innovation on economy. González-Serrano et al. (2019) studied in the sports industry the

280 relationship between innovation performance and GDP per capita. Evidence from EU countries
281 showed a significant positive relationship between the two. Therefore, we use it as a control variable
282 in regression analysis.

283 (2) Electricity consumption (E): The existing literature takes electricity consumption to
284 measure the level of industrial development in a country or region (Yuan et al. 2007). Evidence from
285 Malaysia suggests that the decrease of electricity consumption normally complied with more
286 innovation activities (Tang and Tan, 2013). Fei and Rasiah (2014) pointed that technology
287 innovation required more electricity consumption.

288 (3) Openness (O): In developing countries, although trade openness may lead to the dilemma
289 of “low-end lock-in” in the domestic manufacturing industry due to intensified import competition,
290 it can also significantly promote innovation (Belazreg and Mtar et al., 2020). Dotta and Munyo
291 (2019) provided an assessment of policies that promote trade openness. According to the results,
292 the policy has a clear role in promoting the improvement of a country's innovation ability. Therefore,
293 we incorporated openness into the regression equation.

294 (4) Transportation (TR): Improvements in transportation facilities tend to be positively
295 correlated with regional innovation (Tang et al., 2022). Agrawal et al. (2017) found that the traffic
296 facilities in the region will improve the innovation effect by affecting the flow of knowledge and
297 information. In this paper, we introduce the urban road area to examine the effect of transportation
298 in the regression model.

299 (5) Telecommunications (TE): Evidence from China and Pakistan showed that the
300 telecommunication industry is an important guarantee for economic development and policy
301 implementation. The improvement of industrial modernization and innovation capability is
302 inseparable from the support of the telecommunication industry (Fei and Rasiah 2014; Owoeye et
303 al. 2020;). Therefore, we use the total amount of telecom business to measure telecom.

304 (6) Energy Intensity (EI): An increase of innovation activities often occurs simultaneously with
305 the improvement of energy consumption and energy efficiency (Chakraborty and Mazzanti 2020),
306 but this situation not uniform across countries. We include energy intensity as a control variable in
307 the baseline regression.

308 To reduce the degree of sample heteroscedasticity and the fluctuation of variables, we take the
309 natural logarithm of each variable in the regression. The variable descriptions are shown in Table 2.

310 During the data merging process, we excluded samples missing key variables. Descriptive statistics
 311 are summarized in Table 3.

312 Table 2 Variable descriptions

Variable types	Name	Descriptions	Sources
Dependent variable	<i>IE</i>	Innovation efficiency	China City Statistical Yearbook; China Statistical Yearbook
DID variable	<i>EPP</i>	Environmental protection policy	China City Statistical Yearbook; China Regional Economic Statistical Yearbook
Control variables	<i>G</i>	GDP per capita	China City Statistical Yearbook
	<i>E</i>	Electricity consumption	
	<i>O</i>	Openness of international trade	
	<i>TR</i>	Urban road area	
	<i>TE</i>	Total amount of telecom business	
	<i>EI</i>	Energy Intensity	

313

314 Table 3 Descriptive statistics

VARIABLES	(1) N	(2) mean	(3) std.	(4) min	(5) max
IE	3,047	0.416	0.216	0.107	1
EPP	3,047	0.580	0.186	0	0.945
G	3,047	50,666	317,474	2,767	1.444e+07
E	3,047	78.03	117.9	0.805	1,020
O	3,047	72,112	179,631	4.500	3.083e+06
TR	3,047	8,864	8,754	346	95,009
TE	3,047	426,192	796,985	11,989	1.469e+07
EI	3,047	196.8	298.1	2.037	2,580

315

316

317 3.4 Innovation efficiency

318 The measurement of efficiency measurement in the existing literature can be mainly divided
 319 into two categories. The first is the parametric method represented by the stochastic frontier

320 production function analysis (SFA). SFA is a method for estimating efficiency parameters based on
321 stochastic frontier production function. This method first assumes that the production function is
322 equal to the random error distribution (Aigner, Lovell, and Schmidt 1977; Meeusen and Broeck
323 1977; Battese and Corra 1977). The second is the non-parametric method represented by data
324 envelopment analysis (DEA), which requires neither the setting of the production function nor the
325 estimated parameters, and thus is more convenient to use. Compared with the advantages of DEA,
326 SFA requires the estimation of input-output production model, and is easily affected by the
327 dimension of index data. However, the disadvantage of DEA is that it is easy to ignore the relaxation
328 factors and unexpected output factors, and then overestimate the efficiency level. The decision-
329 making unit with efficiency value of 1 cannot be deeply studied. To modify this model, Tone
330 proposed SBM model in 2001, and then proposed super SBM model in 2002. The super SBM model
331 distinguishes and sorts all decision-making units whose efficiency value is greater than 1, and also
332 takes into account the relaxation variables. Based on Tone (2002), this paper draws on the efficiency
333 estimation method of Wang et al. (2020), Fan, Dai, and Zhang (2021) and Tang et al.(2022) ,and
334 slack factor and undesired output are added on the basis of traditional DEA, The innovation
335 efficiency is measured by constructing the SBM-based Super SBM-DEA model. The following is
336 the specific equation model:

$$\begin{aligned}
\rho^* = \min \rho = \min & \frac{1 - \left(\frac{1}{N} \sum_{n=1}^N \frac{s_n^x}{x_n^k} \right)}{1 + \left[\frac{1}{M+I} \left(\sum_{m=1}^M \frac{s_m^y}{y_m^k} \right) + \sum_{i=1}^I b_i^{k'} \right]} \\
& \sum_{k=1}^K z_k^y y_m^k s_m^y y_m^{k'} \\
\text{constraint condition} & \begin{cases} \sum_{k=1}^{K^v} z_k^b b_i^k + s_i^b = b_i^{k'}, i=1, \dots, I \\ \sum_{k=1}^K z_k^x x_n^k + s_n^x = x_n^{k'}, n=1, \dots, N \\ z_k^i s_m^y s_i^b s_n^x \end{cases} \quad (2)
\end{aligned}$$

338 where ρ is the calculated efficiency. The slack factors are s_m^y , s_i^b , and s_n^x . y_m^k , b_i^k , and x_n^k are the input
339 and output values of the k' production unit in period t' . The input variables most directly related to
340 innovation activities are R&D capital and talents. For R&D capital, we measure it by R&D
341 expenditure and new product development expenditure; for R&D talents, we measure it by the
342 number of R&D practitioners. The weight of input and output variables are determined by z_k^y and
343 z_k^x . When there is an efficiency loss in the production unit, it can be improved by optimizing the
344 input quantity N , the desired output M , and the undesired output I . In addition, we choose

345 government support, informatization level, marketization level and local financial science and
346 technology expenditure to measure innovation environment variables.

347 In the robustness test, we measure the innovation ability through the number of patents granted.
348 In this study, total factor productivity (TFP) is used as the proxy variable of technological innovation
349 factors, and the number of scientific research practitioners is used as the proxy variable of diffusion
350 effect in the regression. Among them, the number of scientific research practitioners can effectively
351 reflect the level of human capital, and TFP is often regarded as an indicator of scientific and
352 technological progress. We downloaded and sorted out the number of scientific research
353 practitioners from 2006 to 2016 from China Urban Statistical Yearbook and China Statistical
354 Yearbook, and collected the grant of patents at the urban level from China's national intellectual
355 property database.

356 3.5 Environmental regulation

357 There are three methods to measure the level of environmental testing. First, a single indicator
358 is used to measure the intensity of environmental regulation, including environmental regulatory
359 policies, environmental governance inputs, and environmental policy performance indicators
360 (Aiken et al. 2009). In addition, some scholars use indirect indicators, such as per capita income, to
361 measure the intensity of environmental regulation (Cole et al. 2008). Second, pollution emissions
362 are used to construct comprehensive indicators. For example, five individual indicators, such as the
363 sulfur dioxide removal rate and industrial soot removal rate, were selected to calculate the
364 comprehensive index to reflect the intensity of regional environmental regulations. Third, assign a
365 score to the strictness of environmental regulations according to certain rules. For example, VanBeer
366 and VandenBergh (1997) set up a quantitative system with a total score of 24 points by constructing
367 an environmental regulation intensity system to measure the intensity of national environmental
368 regulations.

369 In summary, the single indicator method may lead to bias in the research conclusion, because
370 it is only measured from a certain aspect of environmental regulation. The assignment scoring
371 method is difficult to avoid the interference of human subjective factors, while the search limitations
372 of urban data make it impossible to examine the intensity of environmental regulations from
373 different perspectives. Based on this, the level of environmental supervision is measured by
374 comprehensive index method in this study, which included five individual indicators: industrial

375 smoke (powder) dust removal rate, industrial SO₂ removal rate, comprehensive utilization rate of
376 general industrial solid waste, harmless treatment rate of domestic waste, and centralized treatment
377 rate of sewage treatment plants. The calculation steps were as follows: first, all the indicators were
378 standardized; second, the entropy value method was used to determine the index weights, and the
379 environmental regulation composite index was calculated according to the weights and standardized
380 values. The higher the composite index score, the stricter the government's regulation of the
381 environment.

382 3.6. Urban form

383 The overall physical composition of a city is called urban form, specifically, the physical
384 environment of the city and the spatial structure and structure of various activities (Anderson et al.
385 1996). Urban form is composed of two parts: tangible form and intangible form (Ewing 1997). In
386 detail, urban form is the external spatial manifestation of the endogenous elements of urban
387 development, and the reflection of the city's internal political, economic, social structure, and
388 cultural traditions in urban settlements, urban plane form, internal organization, architecture, and
389 the layout of building groups. Since the late 1970s, China has entered a process of rapid urbanization,
390 which has involved a series of enormous restructuring of economic and social structures. The
391 development of cities and economy is changing the basic natural form and structure of Chinese
392 cities. China's urban form has undergone substantial changes due to changes in transportation and
393 housing due to development needs. We chose Fractal Dimension (FD), Largest Patch Index (LPI)
394 and Patch Density (PD) to estimate urban form. The data comes from the China Urban Statistical
395 Yearbook and the China Urban Construction Statistical Yearbook. Further, we used ArcGIS 10.2 to
396 complete the urban land map and calculated the urban land area of each city. We used the R data
397 package SDM Tools to calculate the urban form indexes.

398 First, urban spatial form has self-similarity, and FD is used to quantify the self-similar
399 characteristics of urban spatial form. There are mainly two methods for measuring the FD of the
400 surface shape: the small box counting method and the formula calculation method. In this paper, the
401 formula calculation method is used to measure FD of urban land shape in each city, namely:
402 $FD = \ln a / 2 \ln (0.25p)$, where a denotes the total area and P denotes the side length of urban land.
403 FD is an indicator of the complexity of urban form. In the early stage of urban development, the
404 urban structure still needs to be improved. When the city develops to the later stage, FD will tend

405 to be stable (Chen 2011).

406 Second, the element characteristics of urban agglomerations constitute the basis for the scale
407 efficiency of urban form (Pham et al. 2011). LPI is currently the mainstream method to measure the
408 element characteristics of urban form. LPI is measured by the proportion of the largest urban land
409 patch, that is, the proportion of the largest urban land patch in the total urban land area. The
410 calculation formula is: $LPI = \max a_i / a$, where a_i denotes the area of the largest urban land patch i ,
411 and a denotes the total area. LPI is the central agglomeration degree of urban land. A higher LPI
412 value indicates that urban development is mainly concentrated in a continuous area, and its urban
413 form is more compact (Zelenyuk 2015).

414 Third, we use PD to measure the structural characteristics of urban agglomerations. PD
415 represents the average land area corresponding to each land patch within the city's administrative
416 area. PD is often used in landscape ecology research. Patch is the basic unit of landscape pattern,
417 which refers to the non-linear area with similar characteristics that is different from the surrounding
418 background. The higher the PD, the greater the fragmentation of urban land, and the lower the urban
419 traffic efficiency and the use efficiency of municipal facilities. The calculation formula of PD is:
420 $PD = i/a$, where i denotes the number of urban patches, and a denotes the total area. An increase in
421 PD suggests that new development is more dispersed, leading to higher fragmentation and a higher
422 risk of urban sprawl (Schneider, and Woodcock 2008).

423

424 4. Results

425 4.1 Parallel trend test

426 DID is an effective tool for policy effect evaluation. This paper will analyze the promotion effect of
427 ER on innovation efficiency through double difference model. The principle is to observe the
428 changes of dependent variables in the case of whether the policy occurs or not under the theoretical
429 framework of counterfactual. The premise of using DID method is that the two groups of samples
430 (control group and experimental group) must have the same development trend. If the development
431 trend is different, it means that other factors affect the changes of the explained variables. In other
432 words, parallel trend test is the basic premise of empirical research. Therefore, following Alder
433 (2013), we test the parallel trend hypothesis by adding the interaction terms of the time dummy
434 variables with the treatment group before and after the opening of the EPP, respectively. The

435 dynamic evolution of the effect of EPP on innovation efficiency is also analyzed. The regression
 436 model is as follows:

$$437 \quad IE_{it} = \beta_0 + \beta_1 EPP2009_{it} + \beta_2 EPP2010_{it} + \beta_3 EPP2012_{it} \\ 438 \quad + \beta_4 EPP2013_{it} + \gamma X_{it} + \Phi_t + \mu_i + \varepsilon_{it} \quad (3)$$

439 The results are shown in Table.4. The interaction term coefficients of the year dummy in 2009 and
 440 2010 are not significant. The interaction term coefficients of the year dummy in both 2012 and 2013
 441 are significant at the 1% level. Hence, the regression results satisfy the assumption of parallel trends,
 442 while EPP has a significant and long-term positive effect on innovation efficiency over time.

443 Table 4. Parallel trend test

Variables	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
EPP2009	-0.015 (0.011)			
EPP2010		0.014 (0.011)		
EPP2012			0.095*** (0.009)	
EPP2013				0.079*** (0.008)
LnG	-0.003 (0.007)	0.018** (0.007)	0.033*** (0.007)	0.026*** (0.007)
LnE	0.058*** (0.020)	0.063*** (0.020)	0.067*** (0.020)	0.067*** (0.020)
LnO	0.013*** (0.003)	0.014*** (0.003)	0.014*** (0.003)	0.013*** (0.003)
LnTR	0.013** (0.006)	0.022*** (0.006)	0.024*** (0.005)	0.018*** (0.005)
LnTE	0.006 (0.006)	0.011* (0.006)	0.016*** (0.006)	0.017*** (0.006)
LnEI	0.078*** (0.020)	0.071*** (0.020)	0.067*** (0.020)	0.070*** (0.020)
Constant	0.551*** (0.091)	0.953*** (0.093)	1.210*** (0.084)	1.073*** (0.080)
Observations	3,047	3,047	3,047	3,047
Year FE	YES	YES	YES	YES
City FE	YES	YES	YES	YES

444 Note: robust standard error in parentheses; (2) ***, **, and * indicates 1%, 5%, and 10% significance levels,
445 respectively.

446 4.2 Baseline regression

447 We conduct the baseline regression by using a panel fixed effects model, and the results are
448 shown in Table 5. We include both year fixed effects and city fixed effects in the regression. Among
449 them, the year fixed effects exclude the influencing factors that change over time, while the city
450 fixed effects control for the heterogeneity of cities. Without including any control variables in
451 column (1) of Table 5, the results show that the coefficient is positive and significant at the 1% level,
452 which indicates that EPP significantly improves innovation efficiency. The quantity of innovation
453 efficiency between cities increased by 9.5% after the implementation of the EPP. These results are
454 consistent with those of Dong et al. (2020). From the perspective of environmental externalities,
455 technological innovation needs more policy support to reach the optimal level for society.

456 Promoting innovation depends on two policies: environmental policy, which corrects
457 environmental externalities, and technology policies to correct failures in the technology market.
458 Effective environmental policies will put pressure on companies to reduce emissions, forming a
459 shadow price for emissions and helping to induce technological innovation. This is a necessary form
460 of government intervention. Regarding the coefficient of the control variables, GDP can
461 significantly contribute to innovation efficiency. This is consistent with the findings of Howells
462 (2005). During the sample period, China's economy developed rapidly, and the long-term
463 accumulation of capital promoted China's innovation efficiency. Transportation has a significant
464 and positive correlation with innovation efficiency. As a major locus for infrastructure construction,
465 the rapid development of China's transportation facilities, especially the construction of highways,
466 has garnered global attention. The improvement of transportation facilities has further promoted the
467 cross-regional flow of innovative elements. As a measure of the level of industrial development in
468 a region, the higher the level of electricity consumption in the region, the higher the level of
469 innovation efficiency.

470 Overall, rising energy intensity can promote innovation efficiency. Column (7) shows that
471 higher openness favors technology transfer and reduces pollution emissions. Similarly, the existing
472 literature reveals that developing economies represented by China should expand the scale of trade
473 opening up and benefit from the advanced technology of other developed countries. Managing trade

474 flows and designing comprehensive technical, trade, and environmental policies can achieve
 475 sustainable economic development. In addition, the development of China's telecommunications
 476 industry has also promoted the improvement of regional innovation efficiency.

477

Table 5. Baseline regression

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
Variables	FE						
EPP	0.015** (0.006)	0.071*** (0.009)	0.077*** (0.010)	0.082*** (0.010)	0.094*** (0.010)	0.096*** (0.010)	0.095*** (0.010)
LnG		0.055*** (0.007)	0.051*** (0.007)	0.043*** (0.007)	0.036*** (0.007)	0.032*** (0.007)	0.034*** (0.007)
LnE			0.015** (0.008)	0.011 (0.008)	0.007 (0.008)	0.006 (0.008)	0.068*** (0.020)
LnO				0.016*** (0.003)	0.015*** (0.003)	0.015*** (0.003)	0.015*** (0.003)
LnTR					0.027*** (0.005)	0.026*** (0.006)	0.027*** (0.006)
LnTE						0.013** (0.006)	0.013** (0.006)
LnEI							0.067*** (0.020)
Constant	0.410*** (0.003)	0.958*** (0.067)	0.966*** (0.067)	1.020*** (0.067)	1.161*** (0.073)	1.273*** (0.087)	1.208*** (0.089)
Observations	3,047	3,047	3,047	3,047	3,047	3,047	3,047
Year FE	YES						
City FE	YES						

478 Note: robust standard error in parentheses; (2) ***, **, and * indicates 1%, 5%, and 10% significance levels,
 479 respectively.

480 4.3. Robustness test

481 4.3.1 Robustness test based on different measurements of innovation

482 **In existing literatures, patents are commonly used to measure the innovation ability of an**
 483 **enterprise or a region. Therefore, we first use the number of patents granted to measure innovation.**

484 The results in Table 6 show that there is a significant positive relationship between EPP and the
 485 number of patents granted. Second, we use TFP as a dependent variable into the regression. The

486 results show that EPP also promotes TFP. Finally, we use the number of scientific research
 487 practitioners to measure innovation, and there is still a positive relationship between the two.

488 This reflects the technological innovation and diffusion effects of environmental policies.
 489 Foreign technology generally diffuses domestically through two channels: one is directly adopted
 490 by domestic manufacturers, and the other is to affect the productivity of domestic research and
 491 development. For the former, existing patents from foreign countries are rapidly being used
 492 domestically. For the latter, foreign technology generally needs to be localized through domestic
 493 research and development, which can be observed by the international citation of patents (Popp et
 494 al. 2010). Recent studies have used patent data to classify technological innovation in detail, and
 495 most empirical studies have found that national environmental policies play a positive role in
 496 promoting green technology innovation. In a study using pollution abatement expenditure (PACE)
 497 as a policy proxy variable, Brunnermeier and Cohen (2003) found that the impact of PACE on
 498 environmental innovation in U.S. manufacturing firms was significantly positive, but the impact of
 499 government monitoring and enforcement was not significant. In addition, observational data and
 500 survey data reached similar conclusions. Johnstone et al. (2012) surveyed data using patent and firm
 501 perceptions of environmental policy strength and found that environmental regulation has a positive
 502 inducement effect on clean-tech innovation.

503 Table 6. Robustness test based on different measurements of innovation

Variables	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)
EPP	2.398*** (0.030)	1.256*** (0.043)	0.048*** (0.005)	0.003 (0.009)	3.542*** (0.141)	2.301*** (0.232)
LnG		-0.639*** (0.033)		-0.034*** (0.007)		-0.956*** (0.175)
LnE		0.010 (0.087)		-0.021 (0.018)		0.033 (0.466)
LnO		-0.022* (0.012)		0.002 (0.003)		0.428*** (0.065)
LnTR		-0.201*** (0.024)		-0.005 (0.005)		0.328** (0.130)
LnTE		-0.161*** (0.026)		-0.011** (0.005)		-0.761*** (0.137)
Energy		0.311*** (0.087)		-0.019 (0.018)		0.758 (0.466)

Constant	5.864*** (0.015)	-5.650*** (0.394)	-0.068*** (0.003)	-0.549*** (0.081)	-1.145*** (0.070)	-16.336*** (2.111)
Observations	3,047	3,047	3,047	3,047	3,047	3,047
Year FE	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
City FE	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES

504 Note: robust standard error in parentheses; (2) ***, **, and * indicates 1%, 5%, and 10%
505 significance levels, respectively.

506 4.3.2 Robustness test based on different regression methods

507 We introduce the ordinary least squares (OLS) method, bilateral truncation 1%, bilateral
508 winsorization 1%, and the high-dimensional fixed effect model in this robustness test. The OLS
509 method is carried on the cross-sectional data to test the accuracy of the baseline regression results.
510 Considering that the ER of the city-level extremum may affect the regression results on both ends
511 of the sample, the original samples were subjected to bilateral truncation at the 1% level. The 1%
512 samples with the highest ER value and the 1% samples with the lowest ER values were eliminated
513 before the baseline regression was conducted. Similar to the idea of bilateral truncation, to exclude
514 the influence of outliers on the regression results, this study processed the basic samples by bilateral
515 winsorization (Crinò and Ogliari 2015). The high-dimensional fixed-effects model can enhance the
516 empirical regression efficiency. Columns (1), (3), (5) and (7) in Table 7 shows that the impact of
517 EPP on innovation efficiency is significant when control variables are excluded in the regression.
518 Columns (2), (4), (6) and (8) include the control variables and the results are consistent.

519 Table 7. Robustness test based on different regression methods

Variables	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)
EPP	0.013 (0.011)	-0.048*** (0.013)	0.015** (0.006)	0.095*** (0.010)	0.015** (0.006)	0.094*** (0.010)	0.054** (0.024)	0.049** (0.024)
LnG		-0.047*** (0.008)		0.034*** (0.007)		0.034*** (0.007)		0.004 (0.008)
LnE		-0.005 (0.021)		0.068*** (0.020)		0.068*** (0.020)		0.058*** (0.018)
LnO		0.016*** (0.003)		0.015*** (0.003)		0.015*** (0.003)		0.004 (0.003)
LnTR		0.052*** (0.006)		0.027*** (0.006)		0.027*** (0.005)		0.009* (0.005)

LnTE		-0.029***		0.013**		0.013**		0.017***
		(0.006)		(0.006)		(0.006)		(0.005)
LnEI		0.057***		0.067***		0.067***		0.063***
		(0.021)		(0.020)		(0.020)		(0.018)
Constant	0.411***	-0.087	0.410***	1.208***	0.410***	1.207***	0.396***	0.683***
	(0.006)	(0.090)	(0.003)	(0.089)	(0.003)	(0.089)	(0.009)	(0.115)
Observations	3,047	3,047	3,047	3,047	3,047	3,047	3,047	3,047
Year FE	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
City FE	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES

520 Note: robust standard error in parentheses; (2) ***, **, and * indicates 1%, 5%, and 10%
521 significance levels, respectively.

522 4.4 Mediating effect test

523 The relationship between variables is usually not a direct causal effect, but arises through the
524 indirect influence of one or more mediating variables. We use intermediary effect analysis to judge
525 whether there is a variable that plays an intermediary role between the explanatory variable and the
526 explained variable, and also analyze the impact of this role. The main methods used to test for
527 mediating effects include stepwise regression, Sobel test and Bootstrap test (MacKinnon et al. 2002;
528 Fritz and MacKinnon 2007; Hayes 2009). Although the stepwise regression method has the least
529 statistical efficacy, it is more reliable when the coefficients are significant (MacKinnon et al. 2002).
530 Therefore, we introduce a stepwise regression approach to test the mediating effect of urban form.
531 Stepwise regression is as follows:

$$532 IE_{it} = \beta_0 + \beta_1 EPP_{it} + \gamma X_{it} + \Phi_t + \mu_i + \varepsilon_{it} \quad (5)$$

$$533 UF_{it} = \beta'_0 + \beta'_1 EPP_{it} + \gamma X_{it} + \Phi'_t + \mu'_i + \varepsilon'_{it} \quad (6)$$

$$534 IE_{it} = \beta''_0 + \beta''_1 EPP_{it} + \beta''_2 UF_{it} + \gamma X_{it} + \Phi''_t + \mu''_i + \varepsilon''_{it} \quad (7)$$

535 where β_1 is the total effect of EPP on IE in equation (5); β'_1 is the effect of EPP on UF; β''_2 is the
536 effect of UF on IE after controlling the independent variable EPP; β''_1 is the direct effect of EPP on
537 IE after controlling the meditating variable UF. According to the regression results, we calculate the
538 indirect effect (MacKinnon et al. 1995).

539 First, we use FD to measure urban form. Column (1) and (2) in Table 6 shows that the
540 correlation between EPP and urban form and innovation efficiency shows a positive and significant
541 correlation. Therefore, the indirect effect is significant and Bootstrap test is not required. The results
542 of Column (3) indicate that the direct effect is significant. Thus, the mediating effect of FD accounts

543 for about 9.74% of the total effect. In Columns (4)-(6) of Table 7, we measure urban form by LPI.
 544 The results showed that the mediating effect of LPI was significant, which is about 6.17%. In
 545 Columns (7)-(9) of Table 7, we measure urban form by PD. The mediating effect of PD is also
 546 significant, which is about 2.00%. Thus, there is a significant mediating effect of urban form on the
 547 effect of EPP on innovation efficiency, and the mediating effect differs for different indices of urban
 548 form.

549 In fact, the impact of EPP on cities with different urban forms is heterogeneous. Existing
 550 scholars have reflected that the impact of urban forms on the urban environment is based on the
 551 impact of different types of urban morphological characteristics on energy consumption,
 552 environmental pollution, carbon emissions, biodiversity, and urban climate. For example, Marquez
 553 and Smith (1999) simulated air quality in three forms of cities: corridor, edge, and compact, and
 554 found that compact cities had the smallest air pollutant emissions. When the city matures, urban
 555 form becomes denser and more compact. The accessibility of industries located in different regions
 556 will be greatly improved. This will effectively improve the regional innovation ability through the
 557 flow of innovation elements such as knowledge, science and technology and talents. Specifically,
 558 the progress of regional terms of trade promotes the more flexible flow of scientific and
 559 technological personnel among regions, which drives the forward and backward links of industries
 560 and promotes the interaction between regions, which is the first aspect of the intermediary effect of
 561 urban form. On the other hand, there is an innovation spillover and spatial feedback effect due to
 562 the externality of space, which complies with the results of the robustness test.

563

Table 8. Mediating effect test

Variables	(1) FE	(2) FE	(3) FE	(4) FE	(5) FE	(6) FE	(7) FE	(8) FE	(9) FE
EPP	0.095*** (0.010)	0.014*** (0.001)	0.105*** (0.010)	0.095*** (0.010)	0.014*** (0.003)	0.100*** (0.010)	0.095*** (0.010)	0.009*** (0.002)	0.096*** (0.010)
UF			0.731*** (0.135)			0.418*** (0.073)			0.211* (0.124)
Constant	1.208*** (0.089)	1.480*** (0.013)	2.290*** (0.218)	1.208*** (0.089)	0.519*** (0.023)	0.991*** (0.096)	1.208*** (0.089)	0.012 (0.014)	1.211*** (0.089)
Control Variables	YES								
Observations	3,047	3,047	3,047	3,047	3,047	3,047	3,047	3,047	3,047
Year FE	YES								
City FE	YES								

564 Note: robust standard error in parentheses; (2) ***, **, and * indicates 1%, 5%, and 10%

565 significance levels, respectively.

566 5. Conclusions

567 Both the importance of environmental protection and the sustainability of innovative
568 development have always been important topics in academic research. Since reform and opening
569 up, China has long had an extensive, large-scale, and high-pollution development model. However,
570 as the industrial structure and layout are still not entirely reasonable, the level of pollution
571 prevention and control is still low, and the environmental supervision system requires further
572 development, the environmental protection situation in China remains an area of acute concern.
573 Based on 277 cities in China from 2006 to 2016, we implemented EPP as a quasi-natural experiment
574 to explore its impact on regional innovation efficiency. We introduced DID using a continuous
575 treatment approach. Furthermore, we examine the mediating effect of urban form. The main
576 conclusions are as follows:

577 (1) From a parallel trend test, we showed that treatment and control groups had a common
578 trend before policy implementation, ensuring the accuracy of the DID method. In the baseline
579 regression, we use a DID model that includes the year fixed effect and city fixed effect; the results
580 show that EPP significantly improves regional innovation efficiency in the city. Therefore, the
581 government should fully combine the experience of environmental governance in different
582 economies abroad and consider the heterogeneity of different periods and economic structures.
583 Environmental policies should be formulated precisely by continuously tracking economic and
584 environmental data. Generally speaking, the early stage of EPP implementation often has a certain
585 negative effect on innovation, resulting in a degree of restriction on the innovation efficiency of
586 enterprises in the production field. In later stages, EPP can effectively promote innovation
587 achievements in economically developed areas, and in particular can increase environmental
588 innovations. This makes the coordination between environmental protection and economic
589 development to achieve a macro win-win situation. At the same time, a country's environmental
590 policy is not a simple one-size-fits-all issue, and for cities and industries with a high overall level
591 of development, it should be treated differently and accurately. Conversely, areas with weaker levels
592 of development should also be given a certain degree of leniency, adopt relatively soft
593 environmental regulatory policies, and try to avoid sacrificing economic development for the results
594 of environmental goals.

595 (2) Robustness tests were conducted based on different measurements of innovation and
596 different regression methods. Both results were consistent with the baseline results, showing EPP
597 has technological innovation and diffusion effects. EPP can significantly improve and promote the
598 efficiency of regional innovation. By promoting the cross regional flow of innovative talents and
599 the exchange of scientific research information and the improvement of scientific research level,
600 EPP can stimulate the R & D and application of innovative achievements such as patents. Therefore,
601 the government should adjust the type and strength of environmental policies according to the actual
602 situation, and pursue scientificity and rationality. For China's industrial economy, which is in a
603 critical period of transformation, development, and technological upgrading, it is necessary not only
604 to emphasize technological progress, but also to make full use of the technological innovation and
605 diffusion effect of environmental protection policies. These regions should emphasize the progress
606 of clean and efficient green technologies and actively develop environmental regulation methods
607 aimed at supporting green technologies. At the same time, in order to fill the negative impact of
608 strict environmental regulations on enterprises, the government should use preferential policies to
609 actively support and guide the feedback and driving role of high-tech industries in low- and medium-
610 tech industries. The government should provide incentives and R&D subsidies to basic green
611 technologies that contribute to environmental protection in an effort to achieve continuous emission
612 reduction, automation, and intelligence of the production process in the polluting industrial chain.

613 (3) Previous studies of the impact of EPP on innovation have rarely considered the geographic
614 features of cities. Therefore, considered on the mediating effect of geographical features, as
615 measured by urban form. The results show that urban form has a significant mediating effect on the
616 impact of EPP on innovation efficiency. The mediating effect of FD was 9.74%, that of LPI was
617 6.17%, and that of PD was 2.00%. Cities across China have different economic levels. Regional
618 environmental policies should focus on local geographical location, industrial structure, economic
619 level, and even policy implementation. For developed areas along the eastern coast of China, cities
620 tend to have high innovation vitality, close economic exchanges with neighboring cities, relatively
621 developed technology, capital-intensive industries (e.g., information and communications), and an
622 overall good economic foundation. Therefore, these cities are most suitable for direct environmental
623 regulation and supervision, and effectively promote the green innovation of enterprises. In less
624 developed areas, environmental policies are relatively weak; the strength and direction of

625 technological progress will be affected by these policies, and the output effect of green technology
626 is often insufficient. Tough environmental policies will exacerbate the survival pressure of
627 enterprises and have a significant impact on urban economies. The government should gradually
628 establish softer environmental policies to guide the green innovation of enterprises through a
629 combination of subsidies and industry standards.

630

631 References:

632 Agrawal A, Galasso A, Oettl A (2017) Roads and innovation. *Rev. Econ. Stat* 99(3): 417-434.

633 https://doi.org/10.1162/REST_a_00619

634 Ai H, Yang H, Li K (2021) Impacts of environmental regulation on firm productivity: evidence from
635 China's Top 1000 Energy-Consuming Enterprises Program. *Appl. Econ.* 53(7):830-844.

636 <https://doi.org/10.1080/00036846.2020.1815642>

637 Aigner D, Lovell CAK, Schmidt P (1977) Formulation and estimation of stochastic frontier
638 production function models. *J Econ* 6(1): 21-37. [https://doi.org/10.1016/0304-4076\(77\)90052-5](https://doi.org/10.1016/0304-4076(77)90052-5)

639 Aiken DV, Färe R, Grosskopf, S et al (2009) Pollution abatement and productivity growth: evidence
640 from Germany, Japan, the Netherlands, and the United States. *Environ. Resour. Econ.* 44(1): 11-28.

641 <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10640-008-9256-2>

642 Alder SD, Shao L, Zilibotti F (2016) Economic reforms and industrial policy in a panel of Chinese
643 cities. *J Econ Grow* 21(4): 305-349.

644 Anderson WP, Kanaroglou PS, Miller EJ (1996) Urban form, energy and the environment: a review
645 of issues, evidence and policy. *Urban Stud* 33(1): 7-35.

646 <https://doi.org/10.1080/00420989650012095>

647 Antràs P (2016) Global production: firms, contracts, and trade structure. *J Econ* 120:189-191.

648 <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00712-016-0511-7>

649 Battese GE , Corra GS (1977) Estimation of a production frontier model: with application to the
650 pastoral zone of eastern Australia. *Austr J Agric Econ* 21(3): 169-179. [21. 10.1111/j.1467-](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-8489.1977.tb00204.x)
651 [8489.1977.tb00204.x](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-8489.1977.tb00204.x).

652 Belazreg W, Mtar K (2020) Modelling the causal linkages between trade openness, innovation,
653 financial development and economic growth in OECD Countries. *Appl. Econ. Lett.* 27(1): 5-8.
654 <https://doi.org/10.1080/13504851.2019.1605581>

655 Brunnermeier SB, Cohen MA (2003) Determinants of environmental innovation in US
656 manufacturing industries. *J Envir Econ And Manage* 45(2): 278-293.
657 [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0095-0696\(02\)00058-X](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0095-0696(02)00058-X)

658 Cai X, Zhu B, Zhang HJ, Li L, Xie M (2020) Can direct environmental regulation promote green
659 technology innovation in heavily polluting industries? Evidence from Chinese listed companies. *Sci.*
660 *Total Environ* 746:140810. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2020.140810>

661 Cao Y, Wan N, Zhang H, Zhang X, Zhou Q (2020). Linking environmental regulation and economic
662 growth through technological innovation and resource consumption: Analysis of spatial interaction
663 patterns of urban agglomerations. *Ecol. Indic* 112(C):106062.
664 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolind.2019.106062>.

665 Chakraborty P, Chatterjee C (2017) Does environmental regulation indirectly induce upstream
666 innovation? New evidence from India. *Res. Policy.* 46(5):939-955.
667 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.respol.2017.03.004>.

668 Chakraborty, S K., Mazzanti M (2020) Energy intensity and green energy innovation: checking
669 heterogeneous country effects in the OECD.” *Struct. Change and Econ. Dyn.* 52: 328-343.
670 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.strueco.2019.12.002>

671 Chen Y (2011) Derivation of the functional relations between fractal dimension of and shape indices
672 of urban form. *computers, Environment and Urban Systems* 35(6): 442-451.
673 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compenvurbsys.2011.05.008>

674 Cole MA, Elliott RJR, Strobl E (2008) The environmental performance of firms: The role of foreign
675 ownership, training, and experience. *Ecol. Econ.* 65(3): 538-546.
676 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolecon.2007.07.025>

677 Crane K, Mao ZM. *Costs of Selected Policies to Address Air Pollution in China*. Santa Monica,
678 CA:RAND Corporation 2015.

679 Crinò R, Ogliaz L (2015) Financial frictions, product quality, and international trade. CEPR
680 Discussion Papers No. DP10555. <https://ideas.repec.org/p/ctc/serie1/def030.html>

681 Dechezlepretre A, Glachant M, Hascic I, Jonestone N, Meniere Y (2011) Invention and Transfer of
682 Climate Change-Mitigation Technologies: A Global Analysis . *Rev. Env. Econ. Policy* 5(1):109-
683 130.

684 Dong Z, He Y, Wang H, et al (2020). Is there a ripple effect in environmental regulation in China?–
685 Evidence from the local-neighborhood green technology innovation perspective. *Ecol. Indic.* 118:
686 106773. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolind.2020.106773>

687 Dong Z, He Y, Wang H, Wang L (2020) Is there a ripple effect in environmental regulation in China?
688 – Evidence from the local-neighborhood green technology innovation perspective. *Ecol. Indic.*
689 118:106773. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolind.2020.106773>

690 Dotta V, Munyo I (2019) Trade Openness and Innovation. *The Innovation J* 24(2): 1-13.

691 Ewing R (1997) Is Los Angeles-style sprawl desirable? *J American Planning Association* 63(1):
692 107-126. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01944369708975728>

693 Fan F ,Dai S , and Zhang K, Ke (2021) H.Innovation agglomeration and urban hierarchy: evidence
694 from Chinese Cities. Appl. Econ. 6300-6318.<https://doi.org/10.1080/00036846.2021.1937507>

695 Fan F, Lian H, Liu X, Wang XL (2020) Can environmental regulation promote urban green
696 innovation Efficiency? An empirical study based on Chinese cities. J Cleaner Production
697 287:125060. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2020.125060>.

698 Fan F., Zhang X. R (2011) Transformation effect of resource-based cities based on PSM-DID model:
699 An empirical analysis from China. Environ. Impact Assess. Rev. 91 (11) : 1-12.
700 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eiar.2021.106648>.

701 Fei Q, Rasiah R (2014) Electricity consumption, technological innovation, economic growth and
702 energy prices: does energy export dependency and development levels matter?. Energy Procedia 61:
703 1142-1145. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.egypro.2014.11.1041>

704 Fritz M.S., MacKinnon DP (2007) required sample size to detect the mediated effect. Psychol. Sci.
705 18(3): 233-239. [doi: 10.1111/j.1467-9280.2007.01882.x](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-9280.2007.01882.x).

706 Fu T, Jian Z (2021) Corruption pays off: How environmental regulations promote corporate
707 innovation in a developing country. Ecol. Econ. 183:106909.
708 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolecon.2021.106969>.

709 Galindo MÁ (2014) Méndez MT. Entrepreneurship, economic growth, and innovation: Are
710 feedback effects at work? J. Bus. Res. 67(5): 825-829.
711 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusres.2013.11.052>

712 Grossman, Krueger, A.B (1991) Environmental Impacts of a North American Free Trade Agreement.
713 National Bureau of Economic Research Working Paper No.
714 3914.<https://EconPapers.repec.org/RePEc:nbr:nberwo:3914>.

715 Hamidi S, Zandiatashbar A (2019) Does urban form matter for innovation productivity? A national
716 multi-level study of the association between neighborhood Innovation capacity and urban Sprawl.
717 Urban Stud. 56(8): 1576-1594. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0042098018767002>

718 Hayes A.F (2009) Beyond baron and Kenny: statistical mediation analysis in the new millennium.
719 Commun. Monogr. 76(4): 408-420. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03637750903310360>

720 Hemmelskamp J (1997) Environmental policy instruments and their effects on innovation. Eur. Plan.
721 Stud. 5(2):177-194. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09654319708720392>

722 Hille E, Althammer W, Diederich H (2020) Environmental regulation and innovation in renewable
723 energy technologies: Does the policy instrument matter? Technol. Forecast. Soc. Chang.
724 153(C):119921. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.techfore.2020.119921>.

725 Howells, J (2005) Innovation and Regional Economic Development: A Matter of Perspective? Res.
726 Policy 34(8): 1220-1234. [10.1016/j.respol.2005.03.014](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.respol.2005.03.014).

727 Jaffe AB, Palmer K (1997). Environmental Regulation and Innovation: A Panel Data Study. The
728 Review of Economics and Statistics 79(4): 610-619. <https://doi.org/10.1162/003465397557196>

729 Jaffe AB, Newell RG (2004) Stavins RN. A tale of two market failures: technology and
730 environmental policy. Ecol. Econ. 54(2):164-174. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolecon.2004.12.027>.

731 Jiang Z, Wang Z, Lan X (2021). How environmental regulations affect corporate innovation? The
732 coupling mechanism of mandatory rules and voluntary management. Technol. Soc. 65:101575.
733 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.techsoc.2021.101575>.

734 Jiang Z, Wang Z, Zeng Y (2020) Can voluntary environmental regulation promote corporate
735 technological innovation? Bus. Strateg. Environ. 29(2):390–406. <https://doi.org/10.1002/bse.2372>

736 Joëlle N (2011) Improving the energy efficiency of buildings: The impact of environmental policy

737 on technological innovation. Energy Econ. 34(3):795-806.
738 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eneco.2011.07.015>.

739 Johnstone N, Haščič I, Poirier J, et al (2012) Environmental policy stringency and technological
740 innovation: evidence from survey data and patent counts. Appl. Econ. 44(17): 2157-2170.
741 <https://doi.org/10.1080/00036846.2011.560110>

742 Kelejian HH, Piras G (2014) Estimation of spatial models with endogenous weighting matrices, and
743 an application to a demand model for cigarettes. Reg. Sci. Urban Econ. 46: 140-149.
744 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.regsciurbeco.2014.03.001>.

745 Lanoie P, Lucchetti L, Johnston N, Ambec S (2011) Environmental Policy, innovation and
746 performance: new insights on the porter hypothesis. J Econ & Mana Strat 20:803-842.
747 <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1530-9134.2011.00301.x>

748 Liu Y, Zhu J, Y.Li E, Meng Z, Song Y (2020). Environmental regulation, green technological
749 innovation, and eco-efficiency: The case of Yangtze river economic belt in China. Technol. Forecast.
750 Soc. Chang. 155(C):119993. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.techfore.2020.119993>.

751 Löschel A (2002) Technological change in economic models of environmental policy: a survey. Ecol.
752 Econ. 43(2):105-126. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0921-8009\(02\)00209-4](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0921-8009(02)00209-4).

753 Lv C, Shao C, Lee C (2021) Green technology innovation and financial development: Do
754 environmental regulation and innovation output matter? Energy Econ.
755 98:105237. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eneco.2021.105237>.

756 MacKinnon DP, Lockwood CM, Hoffman JM, West SG, and Sheets VS (2002) A comparison of
757 methods to Test Mediation and Other Intervening Variable Effects. Psychol. Methods 7(1) 83-104 .
758 [doi: 10.1037/1082-989x.7.1.83](https://doi.org/10.1037/1082-989x.7.1.83).

759 Manzoor A, Zheng J (2021) Do innovation in environmental-related technologies cyclically and
760 asymmetrically affect environmental sustainability in BRICS nations? *Technol. Soc.* 67:101746.
761 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.techsoc.2021.101746>

762 Marquez LO, Smith NC (1999) A framework for linking urban form and air quality. *Environ. Modell.*
763 *Softw.* 14(6): 541-548. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S1364-8152\(99\)00018-3](https://doi.org/10.1016/S1364-8152(99)00018-3)

764 Martínez-Zarzoso I, Bengochea-Morancho A, Morales-Lage R (2009). Does environmental policy
765 stringency foster innovation and productivity in OECD countries? *Energy Policy* 134:110982.
766 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.enpol.2019.110982>

767 Meeusen W, van-Den B.J. van-Den (1977) Efficiency estimation from cobb-douglas production
768 functions with composed error. *Int. Econ. Rev.* 18(2):435-444.
769 <https://ideas.repec.org/a/ier/iecrev/v18y1977i2p435-44.html>

770 Nie X, Wu J, Zhang W, Zhang J, Wang W, Wang Y, Luo Y, Wang H(2021). Can environmental
771 regulation promote urban innovation in the underdeveloped coastal regions of western China? *Mar.*
772 *Pol.* 133:104709.<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.marpol.2021.104709>.

773 Owoeye T, Olanipekun DB, Ogunsola AJ, Kutu AA (2020) Energy prices, income and electricity
774 consumption in Africa: the role of technological innovation. *International Journal of Energy*
775 *Economics and Policy* 10(5): 392-440.<https://doi.org/10.32479/ijeeep.9494>

776 Pan X, Ai B, Li C, Pan X, Yan Y (2019) Dynamic relationship among environmental regulation,
777 technological innovation and energy efficiency based on large scale provincial panel data in China.
778 *Technol. Forecast. Soc. Chang.* 144:428-435. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.techfore.2017.12.012>.

779 Peng J, Xie R, Ma C, Fu Y (2021) Market-based environmental regulation and total factor
780 productivity: Evidence from Chinese enterprises. *Econ. Model.* 95:394-407.

781 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.econmod.2020.03.006>.

782 Pham HM, Y. Yamaguchi, and T.Q. Bui (2011) A Case Study on the Relation Between City Planning
783 and Urban Growth Using Remote Sensing and Spatial Metrics. *Landsc. Urban Plan.* 100(3): 223-
784 230. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.landurbplan.2010.12.009>

785 Pickman, H.A (1998) The effect of environmental regulation on environmental innovation. *Bus.*
786 *Strat. Env;* 7: 223-233. [https://doi.org/10.1002/\(SICI\)1099-0836\(199809\)7:4<223::AID-
787 BSE164>3.0.CO;2-S](https://doi.org/10.1002/(SICI)1099-0836(199809)7:4<223::AID-BSE164>3.0.CO;2-S)

788 Popp D (2010) Exploring links between innovation and diffusion: adoption of NO x control
789 technologies at US coal-fired power plants. *Environ. Resour. Econ.* 45(3): 319-352.
790 <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10640-009-9317-1>

791 Porter M E (1991) Towards a dynamic theory of strategy. *Strateg. Manag* 12(S2): 95-117.
792 <http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/smj.4250121008>

793 Qian N (2008) Missing women and the price of tea in China: The effect of sex-specific earnings on
794 sex imbalance. *The Quarterly Journal of Economics* 123(3): 1251-1285.
795 <https://doi.org/10.1162/qjec.2008.123.3.1251>

796 Qin L, Dervis K, Hou Y, Miao X, Muhammad T (2021) Carbon neutrality target for G7 economies:
797 Examining the role of environmental policy, green innovation and composite risk index, *J Environ*
798 *manage* 295:113119. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jenvman.2021.113119>

799 Qu X, and Lee L (2015) Estimating a Spatial Autoregressive Model with an Endogenous Spatial
800 Weight Matrix. *J. Econom.* 184(2): 209-232. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jeconom.2014.08.008>.

801 R DS, P E, Jona LC (2021) Environmental regulation and productivity growth: main policy
802 challenges. *International Economics* 165:264-277. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.inteco.2021.01.002>.

803 R K, K S, G B. How should we study the relationship between environmental regulation and
804 innovation? In: Hemmelskamp J., Rennings K., Leone F (2000) Innovation-Oriented Environmental
805 Regulation. ZEW Economic Studies Physica https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-662-12069-9_4
806 Reis JP, Silva E.A., Pinho P (2016) Spatial metrics to study urban patterns in growing and shrinking
807 cities. Urban Geogr. 37(2): 246-271. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02723638.2015.1096118>
808 Ren S, Sun H, Zhang T (2021). Do environmental subsidies spur environmental innovation?
809 Empirical evidence from Chinese listed firms. Technol. Forecast. Soc. Chang. 173:121123.
810 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.techfore.2021.121123>.
811 Ren W, Ji J (2021) How do environmental regulation and technological innovation affect the
812 sustainable development of marine economy: New evidence from China's coastal provinces and
813 cities. Mar. Pol.;128:104468. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.marpol.2021.104468>.
814 Rennings K, Rammmer C (2011). The Impact of Regulation-Driven Environmental Innovation on
815 Innovation Success and Firm Performance. Ind. Innov. 18(3):255-
816 283. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13662716.2011.561027>
817 Schneider A, Woodcock CE (2008) Compact, dispersed, fragmented, extensive? A comparison of
818 urban growth in twenty-five global cities using remotely sensed data, pattern metrics and census
819 information. Urban Stud. 45(3): 659-692. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0042098007087340>
820 Shi B, Feng C, Qiu M, Ekeland A (2018) Innovation suppression and migration effect: The
821 unintentional consequences of environmental regulation. China Econ. Rev. 49:1-23.
822 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chieco.2017.12.007>.
823 Tang CF, Tan EC (2014) Exploring the Nexus of Electricity Consumption, Economic Growth,
824 Energy Prices and Technology Innovation in Malaysia. Appl. Energy 104: 297-305.

825 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.apenergy.2012.10.061>

826 Tang HY, Zhang JQ, Fan F and Wang ZW (2022) High-speed rail, urban form, and regional
827 innovation: a time-varying difference-in-differences approach. *Technol. Anal. Strateg. Manage.*
828 DOI: 10.1080/09537325.2022.2026322

829 Tone, K (2002) A slacks-based measure of super-efficiency in data envelopment Analysis. *Euro J*
830 *Opera Res* 143: 32–41. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0377-2217\(01\)00324-1](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0377-2217(01)00324-1)

831 van Beers C, van den Bergh J C J M (2000) The impact of environmental policy on foreign trade.
832 Amsterdam: Tinbergen Institute

833 Wang S , Jia M, Zhou Y, and Fan F (2019) Impacts of Changing Urban Form on Ecological
834 Efficiency in China: A Comparison between Urban Agglomerations and Administrative Areas. *J.*
835 *Environ. Plan. Manag.* 63(10): 1834-1856. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09640568.2019.1689932>

836 Yang Q, Gao D, Song D, Li Y (2021). Environmental regulation, pollution reduction and green
837 innovation: The case of the Chinese Water Ecological Civilization City Pilot policy. *Econ. Syst.*
838 45(4):100911. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecosys.2021.100911>.

839 Yuan, J, Zhao C, Yu S, Hu Z (2007) Electricity Consumption and Economic Growth in China:
840 Cointegration and Co-feature Analysis. *Energy Econ.* 29(6): 1179-1191.
841 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eneco.2006.09.005>

842 Zelenyuk, V (2015) Aggregation of scale efficiency. *Eur. J. Oper. Res.* 240(1): 269-277.
843 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ejor.2014.06.038>

844 Zhao L ,Zhang L ,Sun J ,He P (2022) Can public participation constraints promote green
845 technological innovation of Chinese enterprises? The moderating role of government environmental
846 regulatory enforcement. *Technol. Forecast. Soc. Chang.*

847 174:121198.<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.techfore.2021.121198>.

848

849 **Statements and Declarations:**

850 Ethical Approval: Not applicable

851

852 Consent to Participate: Not applicable

853

854 Consent to Publish: Not applicable

855

856 Authors Contributions: All authors contributed extensively to the work presented in the paper.

857 Conceptualization, J.Z. and H.T.; Project administration, J.Z.; Methodology, H.T. and M.B.;

858 Software, M.B. Writing—original draft preparation, H.T.; Writing—review & editing, H.T. and

859 M.B.. All authors have read and approved the final manuscript.

860

861 Funding: This work was supported by the National Social Science Foundation of China (grant

862 number: 19BGJ033); National Natural Science Foundation of China (NSFC) Funded Projects (grant

863 number: 42071154; 71773141); Ministry of Education Philosophy and Social Science Research

864 Funded Project (grant number: 20JHQ064).

865

866 Competing Interests: The authors have no relevant financial or non-financial interests to disclose.

867

868 Availability of data and materials: Not applicable

869

Supplementary Files

This is a list of supplementary files associated with this preprint. Click to download.

- [responsetoeditorcomments.docx](#)